

Samadhi

The significance of mental concentration in early Buddhism

An essay by Piya Tan ©2010

1 Samadhi

1.1 WE ARE EXHORTED TO MEDITATE. Meditation is a central practice of Buddhism,¹ and the Buddha constantly encourages his followers to meditate:

Bhikshus, whatever a teacher should do out of compassion for the good of disciples, for the sake of their welfare, it has been done to you by me.

These, bhikshus, are the foot of trees;² these are empty houses.³ Meditate,⁴ bhikshus! Be not heedless! Regret not later!

This is our instruction to you.”⁵

(S 35.146/4:132 f) = SD 4.12.

This admonition refers to the practice of mindfulness leading to samadhi, or the cultivation of dhyana. As evident from such texts as the *Sāmañña,phala Sutta*,⁶ the *Cūḷa Hatthi, padôpama Sutta*⁷ and the *Mahā Assa, pura Sutta*,⁸ the four dhyanas form an important part of the complete spiritual training of the Buddha’s followers, especially for those going on to attain non-return or arhathood.

The reason for this is clear. Dhyana entails a profound state of mental concentration or samadhi (ts *samādhi*), which in turn forms the basis for insight wisdom (a vital ingredient for non-return and arhathood). As such, the Buddha exhorts his followers in these texts, all named *Samādhi Sutta*, thus:⁹

Cultivate mental concentration, monks. A monk who has mental concentration understands things as they really are.¹⁰ (S 22.5/3:13 f; 35.99/4:80; 56.1/5:414; cf A 5.27/3:24)

The *Samādhi Sutta* 1 (S 22.5) explains the expression “understands things as they really are” (*yathā, - bhūtaṃ pajānāti*) as referring to the stock passage regarding the five aggregates, “Such is form...feeling...perception...formations...consciousness; such is its passing away.”¹¹

¹ If this is the first time you are reading this, it is good to read *Bhāvanā* (SD 15.1) first, as it deals with meditation in general, while this essay deals specifically with samadhi.

² “Those are the foot of trees,” *etāni rukkha, mūlāni*. “Foot” here is usually single, like “bottom.”

³ Sometimes rendered as “empty place”.

⁴ “Meditate!” *jhāyatha*, lit “cultivate *jhāna*” (M 1:45, 118; S 4:133, 4:359, 361, 362, 368, 373; A 3:87, 89, 4:139, 392). Syn *bhāvētha* (2nd pl), “cultivate!”

⁵ This is stock: *Sallekha S* (M 44.18/1:45); *Dvedhā, vitakka S* (M 19.27/1:118); (*Nava Purāṇṇa*) *Kamma S* (S 4:133) = SD 4.12; *Kāya S* (S 43.1/4:359) = SD 12.21.1, & all suttas in the same *Asaṅkhata Saṃyutta* (S 43.2-44/4:360-373); *Yodh’ājīva S 1* (A 5.73.7/3:87), *Yodh’ājīva S 2* (A 5.74.7/89), *Vinaya, dhara S* (A 7.70.4/4:139), *Devatā S* (A 9.19.4/4:392); cf *Mahā Palobhana J* (J 507).

⁶ D 2.67-98/1:71-86.

⁷ M 27.17-26/1:181-184.

⁸ M 389.12-29/1:274-280.

⁹ S 22.5, 35.99, 56.1.

¹⁰ *Samādhin bhikkhave bhāvētha. Samāhito bhikkhave bhikkhu yathā, bhūtaṃ pajānāti*. See DhsA 162.

¹¹ See *Mahā Satipaṭṭhāna S* (D 22.14/2:301 f), *Satipaṭṭhāna S* (M 10.38/1:61), (*Pañca-k, khandha*) *Samādhi S* (S 22.5/3:13f), (*Saḷāyatana*) *Samādhi S* (S 35.99/4:80). See also *Dasa, bala S 1* (S 12.21/2:27 f), *Dasa, bala S 2* (S 12.23/2:29-32), *Sīha S* (S 22.78/3:84-86), *Khemaka S* (S 22.89/ 3:126-132) and *Nāva S* (S 22.101/3:152-155). The origin and passing away of the aggregates are explained in *Paṭisallāna S* (S 22.6/3:15) by way of diachronic conditionality, and in *Upādāna Parivaṭṭa S* (S 22.56/3:58-61 = SD 3.7) & *Satta-ṭ, ṭhāna S* (S 22.57/3:61-65) by way of synchronic conditionality. See S:B 743 n58. [“Diachronic” here “across time,” ie over many, usu 3, lives; “synchronic means within one life-time itself.]

1.2 WHAT IS SAMADHI? Samadhi literally means “the (mental) state of being firmly fixed” (*sam* + *ā* + $\sqrt{DHĀ}$, to put), that is, the fixing of the mind on a single object. It is related to the verb *samādahati*, “to put together” (S 1:169), as in *jotim samādahati*, “he kindles a fire (that is, puts together wood for a fire)” (V 4:115), or “to collect, compose” as in *cittam samādahati*, “he composes his mind, he concentrates” (M 1:116); and the past participle is *samāhita*, “composed, concentrated.”

In the **Cūḷa Vedalla Sutta** (M 44), the nun Dhamma, dinnā explains, “One-pointedness of mind (*cittass’ekaggatā*), avuso Visākha, this is called concentration.”¹² In the stock passage, defining the second dhyana, it is often said to arise from samadhi (*samādhi, ja*, D 2:186).

In the three trainings (*ti sikkhā*) or threefold division (or “aggregate,” *khandha*) of the eightfold path (moral virtue, concentration and wisdom), it is a collective name for the second training (*samādhi, sikkhā*), that is, the last three path-factors (*samādhi khandha*), that is, right effort, right mindfulness, and right concentration.¹³

By itself, samadhi is the last factor of the eightfold path, and often defined as *the attainment of the four dhyanas*.¹⁴ It is one of the five spiritual faculties (*indriya*) and five spiritual powers (*bala*),¹⁵ and one of the seven awakening factors (*bojjhaṅga*).¹⁶ From all this, it is clear that samadhi refers to the one-pointedness of the mind, especially that conducive to dhyana.¹⁷ This is the meaning of *samādhi* that we are most familiar with, but it also has a more general sense, which is just as important, which we shall now examine.

1.3 FUNCTIONS OF SAMADHI. The word *samādhi* often appears in the suttas in a rather broad sense, from being fully focussed in mind, sitting in meditation, to mindful activity, such as walking meditation

¹² M 44.12/1:301 = SD 40a.9; also ar Dhs 15; DhsA 118. Identified with *avikkhepa* (non-agitation) at Dhs 57, and with *samatha* at Dhs 54.

¹³ See **Sīla Samādhi Paññā** = SD 21.6

¹⁴ Eg. “He attains and remains in the first dhyana...the second dhyana...the third dhyana...the fourth dhyana...this is called right concentration”: see **Mahā Satipaṭṭhāna S** (D 22.21/2:313) = SD 13.2; **Mahā Cattārīsaka S** (M 117/3:71-78) = SD 6.10; **Mahā Cattārīsaka S** (M 117/3:71-78) = SD 6.10; **Sacca Vibhaṅga S** (M 141.31/3:252) = SD 11.11. For details on the noble eightfold path, see Gethin 2001:190-226 (ch 6) for an insightful study.

¹⁵ They are faith (*saddhā*), effort (*virīya*), mindfulness (*satī*), concentration (*samādhi*) and wisdom (*paññā*). In the practitioner, they are called “faculties” (*indriya*), as they need to be cultivated; only in the arhat, they become “powers” (*bala*), as they are steady and permanent. See **Āpaṇa S** (S 48.50/5:225 f) = SD 10.4. They are explained in *Comy to Mūla, pariyaṇa S* (M 3) (MA 1:82-84).

¹⁶ The 7 awakening-factors (*satta bojjhaṅga*): (1) mindfulness (*satī*), (2) dharma-discernment (*dhmma, vicaya*), (3) effort (*virīya*), (4) zest (*pīti*), (5) tranquillity (*passaddhī*), (6) concentration (*samādhi*), and (7) equanimity (*upekkhā*). Of the 7 factors, “dharma-discernment” [investigation of stated] (*dhmma, vicaya*), ie, insight into material and mental states as they really are, is a designation for wisdom (*paññā*), and is the key factor here. “Tranquillity” (*passaddhī*) means the stillness both of consciousness (*citta, passaddhī*) and of the mental body (*kāya, passaddhī*) (Abhs 2.5, 7.29 = Abhs: BRS 85-88, 281). Equanimity (*upekkhā*) here means equipoise or mental neutrality (*tatra, majjhat-tatā*), one of the universal beautiful (*sobhana*) cetasikas, and not worldly neutral feeling. See **Bodhi, pakkhiya Dhamma**, SD 10.1(8); **Kāya S** (S 46.2/5:64-67); (**Bojjhaṅga**) **Sīla S** (S 46.3/5:67-70) = SD 10.15; (**Ajjhatta**) **Aṅga S** (S 46.49/5:101), (**Bahiddhā**) **Aṅga S** (S 46.50/5:102), **Āhāra S** (S 46.51/5:102-107) = SD 7.15. For detailed discussion, see R Gethin, *The Path to Awakening*, 2001:146-189 (ch 5).

¹⁷ For 3 kinds of samadhi, viz the empty (*suññata samādhi*), the undirected (*appaṇihita samādhi*), and the signless (*animitta samādhi*): **Suññata Samādhi S** (S 43.4/4:360, 17 = D 33.1.10(51)/3:219, 22 (*rāga, nimittādinam abhāvā appaṇihito*, DA); V 3:92, 37 f (= *rāga, dosa, moha, paṇidhīnam abhāvato appaṇihito*, VA 2:493, 26 ≠ MA 2:367, 9 ≠ DhsA 222, 23 ≠ DA 3:1004, 15) = V 4:25, 32 f; Pm 2:35, 1, qu DhsA 223, 5 ≠ Vism 658, 9; DhA 2:172, 12; Pm 2:36, 12, 41, 12, 59, 10, 65, 15; Abhs 44.6. s explains: One who, at the stage of advanced insight, regards things as *not-self*, acquires the emptiness samadhi on attaining the path and fruit (because he has seen things as being empty of self); one who regards things as *impermanent*, acquires the signless samadhi (because he has seen through the sign of permanence); one who regards things as *suffering*, acquires the undirected samadhi (because he has no attraction to things that are unsatisfactory) (DA 3:1003 f). See also **Suññata Samādhi S** (S 43.4/4:360) = SD 55.8, & the three “doors to liberation” (*vimokkha, mukha*, Pm 2:48; Vism 21.66-73/657-659).

(as in the **Caṅkamaṇa Sutta**, A 5.29).¹⁸ However, it is obvious that although we can gain concentration from walking meditation, it is not easy to gain deep states of focus from such an active posture.

The Samādhi Bhāvanā Sutta (A 4.41) refers to contemplating on the rising and passing of feelings, cognition, and thoughts, and to contemplating on the true nature of the five aggregates as forms of samadhi.¹⁹ Even the four focusses of mindfulness (*satipaṭṭhāna*) is sometimes regarded as samadhi, as stated in **the Saṅkhatta Dhamma Sutta** (A 8.63).²⁰ Such a broad usage of the term *samādhi* is also recorded in **the Saṅgīti Sutta** (D 33), which speaks of four different ways of cultivating samadhi and their benefits [3.2].²¹ As such, **the Pāpaṇika Sutta 1** (A 19) declares samadhi to be a condition for the attaining of wholesome states (*kusala dhamma*).²²

2 Right samadhi

2.1 TWO KINDS OF MENTAL CULTIVATION. Samadhi (ts *samādhi*), as used in the early Buddhist suttas, has two important senses, that is,

- (1) any kind of mindfulness practice that keeps the mind “interactively” focussed, even in a weak way [3.1], or
- (2) right samadhi, that is, a mind “engaged” fully with itself in dhyana [3.2].

Samadhi arises when the mind is free from mental hindrances, and there are two ways of cultivating the mind in this direction, that is, directed cultivation and undirected cultivation.²³

2.1.1 “Directed” cultivation. The first sense of samadhi, a kind of “interactive” focus, is often defined in the suttas as constituting the “concentration aggregate” (*samādhi khandha*),²⁴ or “training in concentration” (*samādhi sikkhā*),²⁵ or as the last limb of the noble eightfold path, that is, right concentration.²⁶

This practical sense of samadhi is fully defined in discourses such as these:

- **Sāmañña,phala Sutta** (D 2), as “accomplishment in concentration (*samādhi,sampadā*),²⁷
- **Ambaṭṭha Sutta** (D 3), as “conduct or practice” (*carāṇa*),²⁸

¹⁸ The Sutta lists the foll 5 benefits of walking meditation: (1) it strengthens one for a journey; (2) it strengthens one for striving; (3) it keeps one healthy; (4) it gives one a good digestion after a meal; and (5) concentration from walking meditation lasts long. (A 5.29/3:29 f) = SD 76.3.

¹⁹ A 4.41/2:45 = SD 24.1.

²⁰ A 8.63/4:300 = SD 46.6. **Cūḷa Vedalla S** (M 44) calls them *nimitta* (M 44.12/1:301), usu tr as “sign,” but it has been suggested that, due to its context here, it should be rendered “basis,” (ie “basis of concentration”) (M:NB 398 & n464)

²¹ Analayo remarks, “These occurrences demonstrate that, as used in the discourses, the term ‘concentration’ (*samādhi*) is not restricted to the development of calm (*samatha*) only, but can also refer to the realm of insight meditation (*vipassanā*).” (2003:72 f)

²² A 3.19/1:115.

²³ See **The Buddha Discovers Dhyana** = SD 33.1b (6.4).

²⁴ **Sāmañña,phala S** (D 2.64-82/1:70-76, *samādhi,sampadā* or “accomplishment in concentration), **Ambaṭṭha S** (D 1:100), **Subha S** (D 10.2.1-19/1:207 f);

²⁵ On the 3 trainings (*ti,sikkhā*), see **Ti Sikkhā S** (A 3.88/1:235) = SD 24.10c & **Sīla Samādhi Paññā**= SD 21.6. See foll n.

²⁶ The noble eightfold path: (1) right view (*sammā diṭṭhi*), (2) right intention [thought] (*sammā saṅkappa*), (3) right action (*sammā kammantā*), (4) right speech (*sammā vācā*), (5) right livelihood (*sammā ājīva*), (6) right effort (*sammā vāyāma*), (7) right mindfulness (*sammā sati*), and (8) right concentration [samadhi] (*sammā samādhi*) (D 2:312; M 1:61, 3:251; Vbh 235). Collectively, (1-3) constitutes the moral virtue aggregate (*sīla khandha*) or training in moral virtue (*sīla sikkhā*), (4-6) mental concentration aggregate (*samādhi khandha*) or training in samadhi (*samādhi sikkhā*), and (1-2) the wisdom aggregate (*paññā khandha*) or training in wisdom (*paññā sikkhā*). See **Sīla Samādhi Paññā** = SD 21.6.

²⁷ D 2.64-82/1:70-76 = SD 8.10.

²⁸ D 3.2.2/1:100 = SD 21.3. Also called “accomplishment in conduct” (*carāṇa sampadā*). The resultant super-knowledges (*abhiññā*) are known as “knowledge” (*vijjā*) or “accomplishment in knowledge” (*vijjā sampadā*). As the Buddha is accomplished in both, he is said to be “accomplished in knowledge and conduct” (*vijjā,carāṇa sampanna*): see eg **Buddhānussati** = SD 15.7 (3.3).

- Subha Sutta (D 10), as “the samadhi aggregate” (*samādhi khandha*),²⁹
- Saṅgīti Sutta (D 33), as “the samadhi aggregate” of the 4 “aggregates” (*khandha*),³⁰
- Mahā Cattārisaka S (M 117), as “right concentration” (*sammā samādhi*),³¹
- Sacca Vibhaṅga Sutta (M 141), as “right concentration” (*sammā samādhi*),³²
- (Magga) Vibhaṅga Sutta (S 45.8), as “right concentration” (*sammā samādhi*),³³
- Hita Sutta 1 (A 3.12), as one of the 5 “accomplishments” (*sampadā*).³⁴

Discourses that use the “three-training” (*ti, sikkhā*) model—such as the Sāmañña,phala Sutta (D 2), the Ambaṭṭha Sutta (D 3), the Subha Sutta (D 10), and Hita Sutta 1 (A 3.12)—invariably treat “training in concentration” (*samādhi sikkhā*) as the second training.³⁵ As such, the training in samadhi or “concentration” here comprises or refers to the following meditation exercises:

- (1) Guarding the sense-doors (*indriyesu gutta, dvāra*),
- (2) Mindfulness and full awareness (*sati sampajañña*),
- (3) Contentment (*saṅtuṭṭhi*),
- (4) Overcoming the mental hindrances³⁶ (*nīvaraṇa pahāna*), and
- (5) The cultivation of four dhyanas (*jhāna bhāvanā*).

Here, we see body-based meditation or “contemplation of the body” (*kāyānupassanā*)—guarding the sense-doors, mindfulness and full awareness, and contentment—being applied as supporting practices to overcome the mental hindrances. “Contemplation of the body,” as is well known, constitutes the first of the four focusses of mindfulness (*satipaṭṭhāna*), which gives the following list of body-based meditation exercises for the development of samadhi, as listed in **the Satipaṭṭhāna Sutta** (M 10), thus:

- (1) The mindfulness of the breath (*ānāpāna, sati*),³⁷
- (2) The four postures (*iriyā, patha*),³⁸
- (3) Full awareness (*sampajañña*),³⁹
- (4) Perception of the foul (the 31 body-parts) (*asubha, saññā*),⁴⁰

²⁹ D 10.2.1-19/1:207 f = SD 40a.13.

³⁰ D 33/1.11(25)/3:229. The 4 “aggregates” are those of moral virtue (*sīla khandha*), of mental concentration (*samādhi khandha*), of wisdom (*paññā khandha*), and of liberation (*vimutti khandha*).

³¹ M 117/3:71-78 = SD 6.10.

³² M 141.31/3:252 = SD 6.10.

³³ S 45.8/5:10 = SD 14.5.

³⁴ A 5.17/3.12. The 5 “accomplishments” (*sampadā*) are those of moral virtue (*sīla sampadā*), of mental concentration (*samādhi sampadā*), of wisdom (*paññā sampadā*), of liberation (*vimutti sampadā*), and of the knowledge and vision of liberation (*vimutti, ñāṇa, dassana sampadā*).

³⁵ The first 3 suttas have been listed above.

³⁶ **The 5 mental hindrances** (*pañca, nīvaraṇa*) are: (1) sensual lust (*kāma-c, chanda*), (2) ill will (*vyāpāda*), (3) restlessness and remorse (*uddhacca, kukkuccha*), (4) sloth and torpor (*thīna, middha*), and (5) doubt (*vicikicchā*): see Mental Hindrances (SD 32) & Saṅgārava S (S 46.55 = SD 3.12). Cf **Mahā Assa, pura S** (M 39.13/1:274); see also **Mahā Satipaṭṭhāna S** (D 22.13); **Satipaṭṭhāna S** (M 10.36) on how to deal with the hindrances during meditation; **Sāmañña, phala S** (D 2.68/1:71) = SD 8.10 (def of dhyana with imageries).

³⁷ Here (and at D 22.20) breath meditation is a 4-step exercise; as 16-step exercise in **Ānāpāna, sati S** (M 118/-3:78-88); as a perception (*saññā*) at **Giri-m-ānanda S** (A 10.60.12-13/5:111 f); and as a “concentration of breath mindfulness” (*ānāpāna, sati, samādhi*) in **Ānāpāna Saṃyutta** (eg S 5:317). See also **Mahā Rāhul’ovāda S** (M 62) = SD 3.11 esp Intro (2).

³⁸ For an expanded version of this exercise, see **Mahā Suññata S** (M 122.11/3:122 f) = SD 11.4. Except for highlighting the 4 postures, this exercise is actually found in the “Full awareness” section which follows and which, in **Sāmañña, phala S** (D 2), is called “mindfulness and full awareness” (*sati sampajañña*) (D 2.65).

³⁹ Here, “full awareness” may be taken as being inclusive of mindfulness (*sati*). See Pug 86; Vism 4.172.

⁴⁰ In the Suttas, this practice is called *asubha, saññā* (perception of foulness). The term *asubha, nimitta* (the sign of foulness) in Comys, refers to one or other of the 10 foul objects, ie bodily remains in one of the 10 stages of

- (5) The analysis of the 4 elements (dhātu vavatthāna),⁴¹
 (6) The 9 charnel-ground meditations (sīvathikā)⁴² (M 10.4-31/1:56-59) = SD 13.3

The first thing we must note here is *the flexibility* of the various meditation exercises as taught by the Buddha. Secondly, there is *a wide choice* of meditation methods for the overcoming of the mental hindrances. Thirdly, these are usually “*directed*” meditations, in the sense that we turn to them when we are distracted from our main meditation or when we fall from concentration. And fourthly, these methods, when properly executed, lead on to samadhi, dhyana, and even insight wisdom.⁴³

2.1.2 How to direct the mind to samadhi. The purpose of directed cultivation (*paṇīdhāya bhāvanā*) is clearly that of overcoming the five mental hindrances. One of the most common and effective ways of freeing the mind from the hindrances is to make it *happy*. The method recommended by the Buddha here is that of turning the mind to an “inspiring sign” (*pasādanīya nimitta*),⁴⁴ as explained in the **Bhikkhūṇī Vāsaka Sutta** (S 47.10), thus:

Here, Ānanda, a monk dwells exertive, clearly aware, mindful, observing...*the four satipatthanas*,...putting away covetousness and displeasure in the world.

While he is observing the body in the body,...

...observing feelings in the feelings,...

...observing the mind in the mind,...

...observing dharmas in the dharmas, there arises in him, based on the body, either a fever in the body or sluggishness in the mind, or the mind is distracted outwardly.⁴⁵

That monk, Ānanda, should then direct his mind towards some inspiring sign.⁴⁶ When he directs his mind towards an inspiring sign, gladness arises.

When he is gladdened, zest arises.

When the mind is zestful, the body becomes tranquil.

When the body is tranquil, he feels joy [happiness].

The mind of the joyful [happy] becomes concentrated.

He reflects thus: “The purpose for the sake of which I have directed my mind has been achieved. Let me now withdraw it.”⁴⁷

decomposition (Vism 6.1-11/178 f). On details of practice, see *Kāya,gatā,sati* S (M 119) = SD 12.21 Intro (5). See also *Vibhaṅga* S (S 51.29/5:277 f), on the analysis of will or desire (*chanda*).

⁴¹ Vism 348 says that the four primary elements are explained at length in *Mahā Hatthi,padōpama* S (M 28.6-27/1185-191 = SD 6.16), *Mahā Rāhul’ovada* S (M 62.8-17/1:421-426 = SD 3.11) and *Dhātu,vibhaṅga* S (M 140.-13-18/3:240-242 = SD 4.17). The 4 elements are explained in some detail in *Mūla,pariyāya* S (M 1). The 6 elements (4 primary elements + space + consciousness) are mentioned in *Saṅgīti* S (D 33.2.1 (16)/3: 248), *Bahu,dhātuka* S (M 115.5/3:62), and *Tiṭṭh’āyatana* S (A 3.61.6/1:175 f = SD 6.8 n here); see also Dhs 638. On how the 4 primary elements cannot exist in themselves, see Boisvert 1995:36 f. Practical meditation instructions on the elements can be found in *Vimm:ESK* 1961:197-205, *Vism* 351, *Pa Auk* 1996:17; *Fryba* 1987:123. For the first 5 elements in later Buddhism, see Lama Govinda, *Foundations of Tibetan Mysticism*, London, 1959:183 ff. See *Khandha 1 Rūpa* = SD 17.2.

⁴² See V 3:36; D 2:295 f; A 3:268, 323; J 1:146; Pv 3.5.2.

⁴³ On directed cultivation leading to insight, see **The Buddha Discovers Dhyana** = SD 33.1b (6.4.2).

⁴⁴ Also called “inspiring meditations.” **The 6 inspiring meditation**, or 6 bases of recollection (*cha anussati-ṭ, ṭhāna*), are the recollections on (1) the Buddha, (2) the Dharma, (3) the Sangha, (4) moral virtue, (5) charity, and (6) the devas. (A 6.26/3:314 f) = SD 15.6. See also **Mental Cultivation** = SD 5, & **Nimitta** = SD 19.7 (4.6.3(2)). On **cultivation of lovingkindness**, see **Karaṇīya Metta S** (Khp 9 = Sn 1.8) = SD 38.3.

⁴⁵ “There arises in him...distracted outwardly,” *tassa kāye kāyānupassino viharato kay’ārammaṇo vā uppajjati kāyasmim̐ pariāho cetaso vā līnattam̐ bahiddhā vā cittam̐ vikkhipati*.

⁴⁶ *Ten’ānanda bhikkhunā kismiñ cid eva pasādaniye nimitte cittam̐ paṇidahitabbam̐*. Comy: A fever of defilement (*kilesa,pariāha*) arises, having made the body its basis (*ārammaṇa*). When this happens, one should not allow oneself to be excited by the it but should then direct the mind to some inspiring sign, that is, one should direct the meditating mind (*kammaṭṭhāna,citta*) to some object that inspires faith, such as the Buddha, etc (SA 3:205).

So he withdraws the mind and he neither applies nor sustains thought.⁴⁸

He understands: “Without initial application and sustained application, internally mindful, I am joyful [happy].”⁴⁹

In this way, Ānanda, there is directed cultivation (*paṇidhāya bhāvanā*).

(S 47.10.7/5:154-156) = SD 24.2⁵⁰

During our meditation, when we are distracted or unable to keep our focus on the meditation object, we should direct our attention to a meditation that inspires and energizes us, such as recollecting the qualities of one of the Three Jewels, or visualizing a joyful time we had keeping the precepts or making offerings to some virtuous or needy persons, or envisioning the wonderful qualities of devas (the moral virtues the accumulated that brought them to their state), or cultivating lovingkindness. As soon as we gain a joyful stillness, we should gently return to the main practice.

2.1.3 “Undirected” cultivation. “Undirected” cultivation (*apaṇidhāya bhāvanā*) usually refers to our meditation when the sign (*nimitta*) begins to appear. From this moment onward, there is nothing to *do*, except to let the samadhi *happen*. This is the only way that it can sublimate itself dhyana.⁵¹ It is somewhat like the simple act of boiling water: first, we make sure that the kettle is clean and empty, and then we fill it up just enough with water. Put the kettle on the stove, turn on the fire, and leave it there to boil. There is nothing we can do to make the water boil faster, except making sure the fire is not disturbed by any gust or does not go out. In time, the water will boil, as if of its own accord.

When the mind is totally free from bodily and mental distractions, it reaches full concentration. With just a gentle attention or subtle thought (this is “initial application” or *vitakka*), we keep the mind on the beautiful stillness, and just let it be there (this is “sustained application” or *vicāra*). These are our last thoughts, as it were, because, zest and bliss (*pīti, sukha*) will pervade our mind that is fully focussed in the present moment of the joyful stillness. This is the first dhyana.

Even after we have attained this profoundly blissful state of the first dhyana, advises the Pabbateyya Gāvi Sutta (A 9.35), we must master it well before going on to the next stage.⁵² For this reason, experienced meditation teachers often advise the beginner, on attaining dhyana, to keep it up for a sustained period, and not to spend too much time discerning them.⁵³ There are the fivefold mastery (*pañca vāsi*) that we must fulfill, namely:

- (1) We must be able to let the mind attain dhyana.
- (2) We must be able to do so fast enough and whenever we wish to do so.
- (3) We must be able to stay in dhyana for as long as we have determined to.
- (4) We must easily emerge from dhyana at the appointed time.
- (5) We must discern the dhyana-factors after emerging.

If we fail to master these skills, we would be mentally stuck, losing what we have attained, and unable to proceed. As such, we should prepare well for this inner journey, and know fully well what *not* to

⁴⁷ That is, redirect it to the original meditation object. (SA 3:206)

⁴⁸ Comy explains that ‘without thinking and pondering’ (*na ca vitakketi na ca vicāreti*) means that he is ‘without defiled thinking, without defiled pondering’ (*kilesa, vitakkaṃ na vitakketi kilesa, vicāraṃ na vicāreti*) (SA 3:206). However, as Bodhi has noted, the absence of thinking (*vitakka*) and pondering (*vicāra*) seems to indicate that he has reached the second dhyana (S:B 1922 n147).

⁴⁹ Comy explains this to mean that he is “without defiled initial application, without defiled sustained application” (SA 3:206). However, the forsaking of initial application and sustained application here implies that one has reached the 2nd dhyanas: see Danta, bhūmi S (M 126), where the 4 satipatthanas lead to the 1st dhyanas, and the satipatthana is to be practised without initial application or sustained application, leading as such to the 2nd dhyanas (M 126.25/3:136).

⁵⁰ On directed cultivation, see further SD 24.2 Intro (1.2). On satipatthana with dhyana, see **Satipaṭṭhāna S** (M 10) = SD 13.1 (4.3b).

⁵¹ On the practice how to let dhyana arise at this point, see *Nimitta* = SD 19.7 (4).

⁵² A 9.35/4:418-422 = SD 24.3.

⁵³ See eg Pa Auk Sayadaw 1999:18, 2003:55.

do so that we let the mind naturally blossom into dhyana.⁵⁴ This excerpt from **the Pabbateyya Gāvī Sutta** gives us a good idea regarding how dhyana “effortlessly,” as it were:

[The first dhyana] Even so, bhikshus, here, a certain monk,⁵⁵ wise, experienced, pasture-wise [knowing the right conditions], skillful, being quite secluded from sensual pleasures, secluded from unwholesome mental states, reaches and dwells in the first dhyana, accompanied by initial application and sustained application, accompanied by zest and happiness, born of solitude.⁵⁶

He enjoys,⁵⁷ cultivates, continuously works on the sign, focusses on it, so that it is well focussed.⁵⁸

[The second dhyana] Then it occurs to him, “What now, if, with the stilling of initial application and sustained application, by gaining inner tranquillity and oneness of mind, I attain and dwell in the second dhyana, free from initial application and sustained application, accompanied by zest and happiness born of concentration?”⁵⁹

Without distracting himself, by gaining inner tranquillity and oneness of mind, he attains and dwells in the second dhyana, free from initial application and sustained application, accompanied by zest and happiness born of concentration.⁶⁰

He enjoys, cultivates, continuously works on the sign, focusses on it, so that it is well focussed.⁶¹

[The third dhyana] Then it occurs to him, “What now, if, with the fading away of zest, [420] I remain equanimous, mindful and clearly knowing, and experience happiness with the body, I attain and dwell in the third dhyana, of which the noble ones declare, ‘Happily he dwells in equanimity and mindfulness?’”

Without distracting himself, he, with the fading away of zest, remain equanimous, mindful and clearly knowing, and experience happiness with the body, attains and dwells in the third dhyana, of which the noble ones declare, ‘Happily he dwells in equanimity and mindfulness.’⁶²

⁵⁴ See “How to attain dhyana,” *Bhāvanā* = SD 15.1 (8.7).

⁵⁵ That is, a meditator.

⁵⁶ *Evam eva kho bhikkhave idh’ekacco bhikkhu paṇḍito vyatto khettaññū kusalo vivicca’eva kāmehi vivicca akusalehi dhammehi savitakkam savicāram vivekajam pīti,sukham paṭhamam jhānam upasampajja viharitum.* Elsewhere, eg **Sāmañña,phala S** (D 2.75b/1:73), this line follows: “He permeates and pervades, floods and fills this very body [the mental body, Vism 4.175/169] with the zest and happiness born of solitude,” see SD 8.10. On the omission of “one-pointedness of mind” (*cittassa ek’aggatā*) and “concentration” (*samādhi*) here, see **The Layman and Dhyana** = SD 8.5.

⁵⁷ *Āsevati*, which has a broad sense of “associating,” thus “to visit, frequent; practise; follow (eg *maggam*); repeat, develop; cultivate; enjoy; often used with *bhaveti* and *bahulī, karoti* (CPD). I render *asevati* here as “he enjoys” as it vitally involves *joy* for the meditation to succeed.

⁵⁸ *So tam nimittam āsevati bhāveti bahulī, karoti svādhiṭṭhitam adhiṭṭhāti.*

⁵⁹ The 2nd dhyana is known as “the noble silence” (*ariya, tuṅhī, bhāva*) because within it initial application and sustained application (thinking and discursion, *vitakka, vicāra*) cease, and with their cessation, speech cannot occur (S 2:273); cf S 4:293 where *vitakka* and *vicāra* are called verbal formation (*vacī, saṅkhāra*), the mental factors responsible for speech. In *Ariya, pariyesanā S* (M 1:161), the Buddha exhorts the monks when assembled to “either speak on the Dharma or observe the noble silence” (ie either talk Dharma or meditate).

⁶⁰ Elsewhere, eg **Sāmañña,phala S** (D 2.77/1:74 f), this line follows: “He permeates and pervades, floods and fills this very body with the zest and happiness born of concentration,” see SD 8.10.

⁶¹ *Tassa evam hoti ‘yan nūnāham vitakka, vicāram vūpasamā ajjhattam sampasādanm cetaso ekodi, bhāvam avitakkam avicāram samādhijam pīti, sukham dutiyam jhānam upasampajja vihareyyan ti, so dutiyam jhānam anabhihiṃsamāno vitakka, vicārānam vūpasamā...pe...dutyam jhānam upasampajja viharati. So tam nimittam āsevati bhāveti bahulī, karoti svādhiṭṭhitam adhiṭṭhāti.*

⁶² Elsewhere, eg **Sāmañña,phala S** (D 2.79/1:75), this line follows: “He permeates and pervades, floods and fills this very body with the happiness free from zest,” see SD 8.10.

He enjoys, cultivates, continuously works on the sign, focusses on it, so that it is well focused.

[The fourth dhyana] Then it occurs to him, “What now, if, with the letting go of pleasure and of pain—and with the earlier ending of happiness and suffering—I attain and dwell in the fourth dhyana, that is neither painful nor pleasant, and with mindfulness fully purified by equanimity?”

Without distracting himself, he, with the letting go of pleasure and of pain, attains and dwells in the fourth dhyana, that is neither painful nor pleasant, and with mindfulness fully purified by equanimity.⁶³

He enjoys, cultivates, continuously works on the sign, focusses on it, so that it is well focused. (A 9.35.2b/4:419) = SD 24.3

2. 2 DHYANA AS BASIS FOR ARHATHOOD. As already mentioned [1.2], “right samadhi” (*sammā samādhi*), the last factor of the noble eightfold path, is often defined as the attainment of the four dhyanas.⁶⁴ This clearly shows that *right* samadhi is a prerequisite for awakening, that is, it requires the attainment of the four dhyanas, at least in theory. This is clear from such discourses as the Sekha Sutta (M 53) that all four dhyanas are needed for the realization of the three knowledges (*te, vijjā*),⁶⁵ that is, for the attainment of arhathood.

However, a number of discourses—such as **the Aṭṭhaka, nagara Sutta** (M 52 = A 11.17), **the Mahā Mālunḱyā, putta Sutta** (M 64), **the Jhāna Sutta** (A 9.36)⁶⁶—state that full awakening may arise even with the attainment of *only the first dhyana*. **The Pavāraṇā Sutta** (S 8.7), in fact, says that of the 500 arhats, only 60 of them have the three knowledges (*te, vijjā*), another 60 the superknowledge (*abhiññā*), and a further 60 the formless attainments (that is, liberated both ways), while the rest are wisdom-liberated.⁶⁷

⁶³ Elsewhere, eg **Sāmañña, phala S** (D 2.81/1:75), this line follows: “He sits, pervading the body with a pure, bright mind, so that there is no part of his entire body that is not pervaded by a pure, bright mind,” see SD 8.10. On the “pure, bright mind,” see **Accharā Vagga** (A 1.6.1 f): “Bhikshus, this mind is radiant (*pabhassara*), but it is defiled by defilements from outside. The uninstructed ordinary person does not understand this as it really is. As such, for him there is no personal development” (A 1.6.1 f/1:10). On reaching the 4th dhyana, the practitioner becomes directly aware of the truly and naturally pure nature of the mind. See also A:ÑB 1999 §4.

⁶⁴ Eg, “He attains and remains in the first dhyana...the second dhyana...the third dhyana...the fourth dhyana...this is called right concentration”: see **Mahā Satipaṭṭhāna S** (D 22.21/2:313) = SD 13.2; **Mahā Cattārīsaka S** (M 117/3:71-78) = SD 6.10; **Mahā Cattārīsaka S** (M 117/3:71-78) = SD 6.10; **Sacca Vibhaṅga S** (M 141.31/3:252) = SD 11.11. For details on the noble eightfold path, see Gethin 2001:190-226 (ch 6) for an insightful study.

⁶⁵ M 53.19/1:357 (SD 12.14). The three knowledges (*te, vijjā*) are: (1) retrocognition (*pubbe, nivāsānussati, ñāna*, ie, the recollection of past lives; (2) the divine eye (*dibba, cakkhu*) or clairvoyance; & (3) the knowledge of the destruction of the mental influxes (*āsava-k, khaya, ñāna*), that ends rebirth (Cv 7.1.4/V 2:183 (Bhaddiya); D 33.1.10-(58)/3:220, 34.1.4(10)/3:275; M 4.27-33/1:22, 27.23-25/1:182 f, 36.38-44/1:2478-249, 39.19-21/1:278-280, 51.24-26/1:347 f, 65.18-21/1:441 f, 76.47-50/1:522, 79.41-44/2:38 f, 101.42-45/2:226 f; S 6.5/1:146* (v582), 8.7/1:192* (v736), 8.9/1:194* (v749); A 3.59.2-4/1:166 f; Sn 656; cf (on the 3rd knowledge, *āsava-k, khaya, ñāna*) M 9.70/1:55, 112.20/3:36. These 3 are superknowledges (*superknowledges*), but only the 3rd is a “direct knowledge” (*aññā*), as it leads to arhathood. The three-knowledge arhat (*te, vijja arahata*) is one who, with *samatha* as basis, have attained 4 or more dhyanas. The *te, vijjā* here is the antithesis of the brahminical *tī-, veda* (A 1:163; Sn 594; SnA 463). See PED, sv vijjā.

⁶⁶ M 52.4/1:350 = A 11.17.3/5:343, M 64.9/1:435; A 9.36.2/4:422 f, respectively.

⁶⁷ S 8.7/1:191 = SD 80.1. Liberation of mind and liberation through wisdom, respectively, *ceto, vimutti* (liberation of mind, ie, liberation by concentration, ie through destruction of the mental hindrances), and *paññā, vimutti* (liberation through insight) (A 1:60). One who is liberated by wisdom (*paññā, vimutta*) “may not have reached the 8 deliverances (*vimokkha = jhāna*) in his own body, but through seeing with wisdom, his mental influxes are destroyed” (M 70.16/1:478); see **(Arahatta) Susīma S** (S 12.70/2:123-127) = SD 16.8. All arhats are perfectly liberated in the same way from ignorance and suffering, but are distinguished into two types on the basis of their proficiency in concentration. Those who can attain the 8 deliverances (*aṭṭha vimokkha*), which include the 4 formless attainments

In other words, less than 70% of the arhats (the wisdom-liberated) have only had a single dhyana experience, that is, attained one of the first three dhyanas.⁶⁸ The Commentaries say that the wisdom-liberated arhat may be one of five kinds: either a bare insight practitioner (*sukkhā, vipassaka*),⁶⁹ or one who has attained to arhathood after arising from one of the (four) dhyanas.⁷⁰

2.3 AWAKENING WITHOUT DHYANA? According to Analayo, a number of discourses—such as the *Jana,vasabha Sutta* (D 18) and the **Mahā Cattārīsaka Sutta** (M 117)—interestingly, do *not* mention dhyana at all in their description of awakening.⁷¹ After quoting the *Mahā Cattārīsaka Sutta* (as “not mentioning dhyana”), Analayo, notes that “[j]udging from other discourses, to speak of ‘unification of mind’ need not necessarily imply absorption [*jhāna*] attainment, since eg A 2:14 [**Caṅkamana Sutta**: 2.3] relates unification of the mind to walking and standing, or at A 3:174 [**Sammatta Niyāma Sutta 1**, A 5.151] unification of the mind occurs while listening to the Dhamma” (2003:74 n29).

Let me address these four suttas quoted by Analayo as examples of texts that do “not mention dhyana.” Firstly, as already noted, the *Jana,vasabha Sutta* (D 18) does mention “one-pointedness of the mind that is produced by these seven factors called the noble right concentration with its supports and requisites.”⁷² The sutta then goes one to progressively link up the ten “rightness” (*sammatta*) factors, beginning with right view and ending with right knowledge, from which arises right liberation. This is clearly a description of the supramundane path leading to arhathood,⁷³ a pattern which is also found in the *Mahā Cattārīsaka Sutta*.⁷⁴ We cannot, from silence alone, argue that no dhyana is implied here, especially where right samadhi is clearly mentioned.

Secondly, and similarly, on a close examination of the **Mahā Cattārīsaka Sutta**, we cannot, from silence alone, say that dhyana is “not” implied—unless there is no mention of right samadhi at all. The sutta defines right samadhi as the oneness or unification of the mind (*cittass’ekaggatā*) interdependent with the other seven path-factors.⁷⁵ Right samadhi, as a path-factor, is always defined at the four dhyana: as such, dhyana is integral to its definition. It must therefore be reiterated that we cannot, from silence alone, argue that no dhyana is implied here, especially where right samadhi is clearly mentioned.

and the attainment of cessation, are called *liberated both ways*, ie, liberated from the physical body by means of the formless dhyanas, and from all defilements by the path of arhathood: see **Mahā,parinibbāna S** (D 16.3.33/2:111 f) = SD 9; **Kīṭa,giri S** (70) = SD 11.1 Intro (5.2(2)); **Mahā Suññata S** (M 122) = SD 11.4 Intro (3.3). For full list of the 8 liberations, see *Mahā Nidāna S* (D 15.35/2:70 f) = SD 5.17.35; also D 3:262, 228; *Vimokkha S*, A 8.66/-4:306; also M 120.37/3:103 = SD 3.4.37. See also **Aṭṭha Vimokkha** (SD 62.5) & Analayo 2009:141-156.

⁶⁸ See esp (**Arahatta**) **Susīma S** (S 12.70.23-57/2:123-127) = SD 16.8; also **Kīṭa,giri S** (M 70) = SD 11.1 Intro 5.2(2).

⁶⁹ The “bare insight practitioner,” however, is not mentioned in the Nikāyas, and as such is generally not recognized by the Sutta-based teachers, but is a popular notion with the contemporary “Vipassana” system. See eg the foll teachers. Mahasi Sayadaw, *Satipatthana Vipassana*, 3rd ed, 2005:283 f. Burmese teacher, Ledi Sayadaw, *The Manuals of Buddhism*, under *Bodhipakkhiya Dīpanī*, ch 8: the 8 *maggaṅga*, where *sukkhā, vipassaka sotāpanna* is mentioned: <http://www.ubakhin.com/ledi/manual6h.htm>; Thai Abhidhamma teacher, Sujin Boriharnwanaket, speaks of “two kinds of *ariya-savaka*, namely, the *sukkhavipassaka* and the *cetovimutti*”: see “Summary of Paramatthadhamma part VIII,” under “The 3 *pariññā*”: <http://www.dhammadstudy.com/paramat8.html> (dated April 14 2000:16).

⁷⁰ MA 3:188; PugA 191. This is a commentarial term and concept, not found in the suttas.

⁷¹ Respectively, D 18.27/2:217, M 117/3:71-78; but in both cases, “right concentration” (= the 4 dhyanas) are mentioned. Similarly, Analayo’s other citations (2003:73)—D 3:252, M 3:7, S 5:21, and A 4:40—all *do* clearly mention dhyana.

⁷² *Yā kho, bho, imehi satta-h-aṅgehi cittassa ekaggatā parikkhatā, ayam vuccati, bho, ariyo sammā, samādhi sa, upaniso iti pi sa, parikkhāro iti pi.*

⁷³ D 18.27/2:217 = SD 62.3.

⁷⁴ M 117.34/3:75 f = SD 6.10.

⁷⁵ “Bhikkhus, I will teach you the noble right concentration (*ariya sammā, samādhi*) with its supports and requisites” (*ariyam vo, bhikkhave, sammā, samādhim desessāmi sa, upanisam sa, parikkhāram*, M 117.2/3:71) = SD 6.10. Requisites,” *sa, parikkhāra*, alt tr “with its equipments” (Gethin 2001:216). Comy says that “noble” (*ariya*) here means “supramundane” (*lok’uttara*), ie, the concentration pertaining to the supramundane path. The phrase “supports and requisites” refers to the other 7 path-factors (M 117.3/3:71; MA 4:130 f).

Thirdly, Analayo, as mentioned, quotes the **Caṅkamaṇa Sutta** (A 5.29) as saying that samadhi can arise during walking meditation,⁷⁶ where it suggests that “‘unification of mind’ need not necessarily imply absorption [*jhāna*] attainment, since [the sutta] relates unification of the mind to walking and standing” (2003:74 n29). I think the issue here is not whether it refers to dhyana or not, but rather that some level of deep focus is present in the walking and the standing meditations.

This profoundly mindful single-minded meditative walking and standing is well illustrated in the events of the first seven weeks after the Great Awakening. It is said that during the first week, the Buddha sits in meditation; the second week, he *stands* in meditation, visualizing the Bodhi tree; the third week, he *walks* meditatively on the elevated Jewelled Walk; the fourth week, he meditates in the jeweled house; the fifth to the seventh weeks, he sits under three different trees each week.⁷⁷

Fourthly, Analayo quotes the **Sammatta Niyāma Sutta 1** (A 5.151) as stating that “unification of the mind occurs while listening to the Dhamma” (2003:74 n29). Again here, the sutta is not addressing the nature of dhyana, but merely listing the proper ways of listening to the Dharma so that we are “able to plunge into the certainty of rightness of wholesome states.”⁷⁸ The lesser streamwinners⁷⁹ are said to be on the course of “rightness” (*sammatta*), which here refers to the eightfold path of the saints. These two individuals, however, are spiritual attainers who are not yet aryas, as suggested by the **Sammatta,niyāma Suttas 1-3** (A 5.151-153). In short, the **Sammatta Niyāma Sutta** (all three of them), are not addressing dhyana, but streamwinning.⁸⁰

Having said all that, we now have a better idea of the difference between *samādhi* and *jhāna*. Samadhi can have a broad sense of mental focus that encompasses a range of mental focus from active mindfulness, such as in walking and standing meditations, to the profound still and bliss of dhyana. Dhyana, however, has a specific sense of a fully focussed mind, free from all mental hindrances, that is, from all bodily activity, and is profoundly still and blissful. We will later discuss to what extent, dhyana also excludes mental activity.⁸¹

In this connection, it is useful to be familiar with the **(Samādhy-aṅga) Pañcaṅgika Sutta** (A 5.28), which teaches the “cultivation of the five-limbed noble right samadhi” (*ariya pañc’āṅgika sammā,samādhi bhāvanā*). This is clearly a teaching on dhyana: the first four limbs are the four dhyanas, and the fifth is the proper attention to the review-sign (*paccavekkhaṇā nimitta*).⁸² That the attending to the review-sign is listed fifth and last shows that it is a practice to be done *after* having attained a dhyana, that is, any of the four dhyanas. Due to the vital significance of this teaching, we will discuss it separately in some detail.⁸³

2.4 AWAKENING WITHOUT DHYANA. In a number of discourses, such as the (Sekha) Uddesa Sutta (A 3.85) and the Sa,upadi,sesa Sutta (A 9.12) [2.5], strongly suggests the possibility of attaining the path without any dhyana. This is especially true for the streamwinner and the once-returner, who do not need perfect concentration, that is, they do not need dhyana (*jhāna*), nor even need to “meditate” (as the term is popularly taken today) to attain to their respective realizations.⁸⁴

⁷⁶ A 5.29/3:29 f = SD 76.3.

⁷⁷ See **Dhamma & Abhidhamma** = SD 26.1 (5), & **The First Seven Weeks** (SD 63.1).

⁷⁸ *Bhabbo niyāmaṃ okkamituṃ kusalesu dhammesu sammataṃ* (A 5.151.3/3:174 f) = SD 4.2. On *sammatta,niyāma*, see Anicca Cakkhu S (S 25.1) = SD 16.7 Intro (1.6).

⁷⁹ *Cūḷa,sotāpanna*, a post-canonical term referring to one who is on the verge to becoming a streamwinner, as suggested by the 10 suttas of the Okkanti Saṃyutta (S 25): see (Anicca) Cakkhu S (S 25.1) = SD 16.7 & Entering the Stream = SD 3.3(6)

⁸⁰ **Sammatta Niyāma 1-3** (S 5.151-3/3:174-176) = SD 4.2-4.

⁸¹ See **Buddha Discovers Dhyana** = SD 33.1b (6.2.1).

⁸² A 5.28/3:27 = SD 33.13. Curiously, Analayo thinks that this sutta “lists what is probably a form of ‘insight’ meditation as an alternative method to develop right concentration” (2003:73 n27).

⁸³ See **The Buddha Discovers Dhyana** = SD 33.1b (6.4.4).

⁸⁴ More on this point, see **Entering the Stream** (SD 3.3).

The (Sekha) Uddesa Sutta (A 3.85) is a definitive discourse on *how the three trainings*⁸⁵ are related to the attaining of sainthood,⁸⁶ and it also clearly defines the streamwinner and the once-returner.⁸⁷ Both the kinds of saints are said to be endowed with moral virtue, and they both have totally destroys the “three fetters.”⁸⁸ The once-returner, however, has also significantly diminished lust, hate and delusion. There is no mention of dhyana here.⁸⁹

According to **the Mahā Saḷāyatanika Sutta** (M 149), when we know and see the six senses, their external objects, the sense-consciousnesses, the sense-contacts and their respective feelings as they really are, then “this noble eightfold comes to fulfillment by cultivation.”⁹⁰ We would be able to keep to a balanced practice of calm and insight via the noble eightfold path, so that he gains direct knowledge and liberation.⁹¹ Notice that there is no mention of dhyana here.⁹²

A briefer statement of this is made in **the Kāmada Sutta** (S 2.6), the Buddha declares that the trainees (*sekha*), that is, the saints of the path short of the arhats, who “delight in calming the mind” (*citta-vūpasame ratā*) and “delight in calming the faculties” (*indriyūpasame ratā*). In doing so, “the path of the noble ones is even” (*ariyānaṃ samo maggo*). Again here there is no mention of dhyana, but a general reference to spiritual training.⁹³

2.5 HOW DHYANA SPEEDS UP AWAKENING. From the title of **the Sa,upādi,sesa Sutta** (A 9.12)—the discourse on those “with residues” (*sa,upādi*)⁹⁴—it is clear that it deals with those who still have the five aggregates of clinging.⁹⁵ The term is applied to nine types of saints, namely, five types of non-returners, the once-returner, and three types of streamwinners. The once-returner is defined in the same words as a streamwinner, except that the once-returner has significantly diminished lust, hate and delusion, too [2.4].

What should interest us here is the Sa,upādi,sesa Sutta’s teachings on streamwinners (*sotāpanna*). Here are the relevant passages from the Sa,upādi,sesa Sutta’s definition of the three kinds of streamwinners:

8 Furthermore, Sāriputta, here a certain person fulfills moral virtue, *but gains only limited concentration, gains only limited wisdom*.⁹⁶ With the total destruction of the three fetters,⁹⁷ he is a single-seeder (*eka,bījī*),⁹⁸ having taken only one more human birth, makes an end of suffering.⁹⁹

⁸⁵ On the 3 trainings, see *Sīla Samādhi Paññā* = SD 21.6 & (Ti) *Sikkhā S* (A 3.88/1:235) = SD 24.10c.

⁸⁶ A 3.85/1:231 f, also called (Mattaso,kārī) *Sikkhā S*. See SD 21.6 for a discussion.

⁸⁷ A 3.85/1:231 f = SD 3.3(2).

⁸⁸ The (first) 3 fetters: see §2(4)n.

⁸⁹ See further **Entering the Stream** = SD 3.3.

⁹⁰ *Evam assāyāṃ ariyo aṭṭh’angiko maggo bhāvanā,pāripūrim gacchati.*

⁹¹ M 149.10/3:289) = SD 41.9.

⁹² I have difficulty understanding what Anālayo means by saying here that “a penetrative understanding of the six senses constitutes right concentration” (2003:73 n27).

⁹³ S 2.6/1:48.

⁹⁴ “With residues of the aggregates of clinging,” *sa,upādi,sesa*, ie “with remains of material support to which one grasps (for rebirth),” viz, the aggregates (*khandha*): form, feeling, perception, mental formation, consciousness. In the Suttas, the word is mostly used in such expressions as “one of the 2 fruits may be expected: either perfect wisdom or, if the groups are still remaining (*sati upādi,sesa*), non-return” (D 22). Also in “Here the Tathāgata has passed into the nirvana-element in which no more groups are remaining (*anupādi,sesa*)” (A 4.118/2:120)—BDict: upādi.

⁹⁵ A 9.12/4:378-382 = SD 3.3(3). On the 5 aggregates, see SD 17, esp Dve Khandha S (S 22.48 = SD 17.1a).

⁹⁶ *Idh’ekacco puggalo sīlesu paripūra,kārī hoti, samādhismiṃ mattaso,kārī* [PTS wr *samādhismiṃ na paripūra,kārī*], *paññāya mattaso,kārī*.

⁹⁷ They are the first 3 of the 10 fetters (*saṃyojana*), viz: (1) self-identify view (*sakkāya,dīṭṭhī*), (2) spiritual doubt (*vicikicchā*), and (3) attachment to rules and rites (*sīla-b,bata,parāmāsa*). The 10 fetters are: (1) self-identity view (*sakkāya,dīṭṭhī*), (2) spiritual doubt (*vicikicchā*), (3) attachment to rules and rites (*sīla-b,bata,parāmāsa*), (4) sensual lust (*kāma,rāga*), (5) repulsion (*paṭigha*), (6) greed for form existence (*nīpa,rāga*), (7) greed for formless existence (*arīpa,rāga*), (8) conceit (*māna*), (9) restlessness (*uddhacca*), (10) ignorance (*avijjā*) (S 5:61, A 5:13, Vbh 377). See further Udakūpama S (A 7.15) = SD 28.6 Intro (1.2) esp 1.2(10)..

9 Furthermore, Sāriputta, here a certain person fulfills moral virtue, *but gains only limited concentration, gains only limited wisdom*. With the total destruction of the three fetters, he is a clan-to-clan-goer (*kolaṇi, kola*),¹⁰⁰ having re-arisen and wandered amongst two or three families, makes an end of suffering.

10 Furthermore, Sāriputta, here a certain person fulfills moral virtue, *but gains only limited concentration, gains only limited wisdom*.¹⁰¹ With the total destruction of the three fetters, he is a seven-at-most (*satta-k, khattu parama*),¹⁰² having re-arisen and wandered amongst gods and humans for seven lives at the most, makes an end of suffering.¹⁰³

(A 9.12.8-10/4:380 f) = SD 3.3(3)

The non-returner (like the arhat) is said to be “fully accomplished in samadhi” (*samādhismiṃ paripūra, kārī*): in other words, he is able to attain dhyana. The streamwinner (like the once-returner), on the other hand, is described as being endowed with moral virtue, but “gains only limited concentration” (*samādhismiṃ mattaso, kārī*). This means that the meditation (such as breath meditation and cultivating lovingkindness) done by the would-be streamwinner is simple or basic, yet helpful, even if dhyana is not attained.

The Udāna Commentary is helpful here in giving a summary of what has been discussed so far, thus:

Or, one reaches the far shore (*pāragū*) by way of realizing the fruit of streamwinning through moral virtue. For, he is said to be one “fully accomplished in moral virtue” (*sīlesu paripūra, kārī*). Here, the once-returner, too, is understood in the same manner as the streamwinner. One reaches the far shore by way of realizing of the fruit of non-return through samadhi. For, he is said to be one “fully accomplished in samadhi” (*samādhismiṃ paripūra, kārī*). One reaches the far shore by way of realizing arhathood in a manner different from these three. (UA 70)¹⁰⁴

The Commentary adds that the arhat cultivates unshakable qualities leading to the far shore (nirvana) through attaining the knowledge and vision of liberation by wisdom and of liberation of mind (that is, by way of deep meditation or dhyana).¹⁰⁵

3 The benefits of samadhi

3.1 EVEN A WEAK SAMADHI IS BENEFICIAL. According to the **Abhidhammattha Saṅgaha**, a 10th-11th century Abhidhamma compendium, concentration, even if it is often very weak, is one of the seven

⁹⁸ *Eka, bījī*.

⁹⁹ *Puna ca paramā sārīputta idh 'ekacco puggalo sīlesu paripūra, kārī hoti, samādhismiṃ mattaso, kārī, paññāya mattaso, kārī. So tinnam samyojanānam parikkhayā eka, bījī hoti ekañ-ñeva mānusakam bhavaṃ nibbattetvā dukkhass'antaṃ karotī.*

¹⁰⁰ *Kolaṇi, kola*.

¹⁰¹ *Idh 'ekacco puggalo sīlesu paripūra, kārī hoti, samādhismiṃ mattaso, kārī, paññāya mattaso, kārī.*

¹⁰² *Satta-k, khattu, parama*.

¹⁰³ *Puna ca paramā sārīputta idh 'ekacco puggalo sīlesu paripūra, kārī hoti samādhismiṃ mattaso, kārī, paññāya mattaso, kārī. So tinnam samyojanānam parikkhayā satta-k, khattu, paramo hoti, satta-k, khattu, paramaṃ deve ca mānuse ca sandhāvitvā saṃsaritvā dukkhass'antaṃ karotī.*

¹⁰⁴ *Atha vā sotāpatti, phalādhigamena sīlasmim pāragū. So hi “sīlesu paripūra, kārī ti vutto, sotāpanna-g, gahaṇen 'eva c'ettha sakadāgāmi'pi gahito hoti. Anāgāmi, phalādhigamena samādhismiṃ pāragū. So hi “samādhismiṃ paripūra, kārī ti vutto. Arahatta, phalādhigamena itaresu tisu pāragū. (UA 70). UA:M 1994:106 is off the mark here.*

¹⁰⁵ The one mind-liberated (*ceto, vimutta*) has destroyed all the mental hindrances, and as such could attain dhyana at will. The wisdom-liberated (*paññā, vimutta*) “may not have reached the eight liberations (*vimokkha* = *jhāna*) in his own body, but through seeing with wisdom, his mental influxes are destroyed” (M 70.16/1:478): see above (2.1) n on “wisdom-liberated.”

mental factors (*cetasika*) inseparably associated with all consciousness.¹⁰⁶ In this wider sense, it is associated with all karmically wholesome (*kusala*) consciousness. Wrong concentration (*micchā samādhi*) is concentration associated with all karmically unwholesome (*akusala*) consciousness. Wherever this term *samādhi* appear in the early texts without any qualification (undifferentiated as “right” or “wrong”), right concentration is meant.

The Commentaries further distinguishes three levels of intensity of mental concentration, that is,

- (1) “Preparatory concentration” (*parikamma samādhi*) existing at the beginning of the mental exercise.
- (2) “Neighbourhood [Access] concentration” (*upacāra samādhi*), that is, concentration “approaching” but not yet attaining the first dhyana, which in certain mental exercises is marked by the appearance of the so-called “counter-image” (*paṭibhāga nimitta*).
- (3) “Attainment [Full] concentration” (*appanā samādhi*), that is, the concentration which characterizes the dhyanas.¹⁰⁷

In this connection, meditation teachers often speak of another set of three kinds of samadhi, namely, momentary concentration (*khaṇika samādhi*), access (or neighbourhood) concentration (*upacāra samādhi*), and full concentration (*appanā samādhi*).¹⁰⁸ According to the Commentator, Dhammapāla, momentary concentration is simply access concentration interspersed with sense-consciousness, with the counter-part sign and dhyana-factors as object.¹⁰⁹

3.2 BENEFITS OF SAMADHI. Samadhi, when properly developed, flowers in dhyana, when the mind, transcending its bodily limits, fully experiences itself, attended by profound bliss. According to **the Saṅgīti Sutta** (D 33), the cultivation of concentration (*samādhi bhāvanā*) may bring about these four blessings:

- (1) present happiness (*diṭṭha, dhamma sukha*) through the four dhyana;
- (2) knowledge and vision (*ñāna, dassana*);¹¹⁰
- (3) mindfulness and clear awareness (*sati sampajañña*) through the full knowing of the arising, persisting and passing of feelings, perceptions and thoughts;
- (4) destruction of all influxes (*āsava-k, khaya*) through understanding the arising and passing away of the five aggregates of clinging (*pañc’upādāna-k, khandha*). (D 33.1.11(5)/3:222 f)

The four “ways of cultivating samadhi” (*samādhi bhāvanā*) are defined in **the Samādhi Bhāvanā Sutta** (A 4.41).¹¹¹

3.3 CONCLUSION. Concentration connected with the four noble path-moments (*magga*) and four fruition-moments (*phala*)—that is, those of the eight kind of saints—is called supramundane (*lokuttara*), that is, having nirvana as object. Any other concentration (whether of worldlings or the saints), even that of the sublimest dhyanas, is merely mundane (*lokiya*).¹¹²

We are made up of body and mind. The body comprises the five physical sense-doors through which sense-data regularly enter our minds and occupy it. There is such a flood of sense-data that we can easily

¹⁰⁶ These 7 mental factors are known as “universals” (*sabba, citta, sādharma*), viz, contact (*phassa*), feeling (*vedanā*), perception (*saññā*), volition (*cetanā*), one-pointedness (*ekaggatā*, ie concentration, *samādhi*), mental vitality (*jīvit’indriya*), and attention (*manasikāra*) (Abhs 2.2 = Abhs:BRS 78-81); BDict, svv *nāma, cetanā*.

¹⁰⁷ Vism 3/84-117, 4.27-31/125 f; Abhs:BRS 9.16-18/340-342; Abhs:SR 203. See *Bhāvanā*, SD 15.1(9.3); BDict: *bhāvana*; also Nyanatiloka, *Fundamentals of Buddhism*, Tokyo, 1920: IV “Mental culture”: free download from <http://www.accesstoinight.org/lib/authors/nyanatiloka/wheel394.html>.

¹⁰⁸ All 3 are mentioned in DhsA 117; Vism 144; only *upacāra samādhi* and *appanā samādhi* are mentioned at Vism 85, 371 (ie besides DhsA 117; Vism 144). The Abhidhamm’attha Saṅgaha speaks of *parikamma bhāvanā*, *upacāra bhāvanā* and *appanā bhāvanā* (Abhs:BRS 9.5/331; Abhs:SR 203; Abhs:WG 328), showing their relationships with the 3 kinds of samadhi here. See *Bhāvanā* = SD 15.1 (9.4) & Fig 9.6.

¹⁰⁹ See LS Cousins 1996:47.

¹¹⁰ Here, prob it is the divine eye (*dibba, cakkhu*) arising through perception of light (*āloka sañña*).

¹¹¹ A 4.41/2:45 = SD 24.1.

¹¹² On *lokiya* and *lok’uttara*, see S:B 1490-92.

drench or drown in them, if not be washed away by them. We also need to attend our various bodily needs and processes.

Even when we think we are in control of ourselves, we are covered up by our senses, so that we are like the emperor in his *old* clothes. The senses habitually delight in old and familiar pleasurable sense-data, rejecting what is seen as unpleasurable, and ignoring what appears to be neither.¹¹³ As such, to see our true selves, we need to give up the dresses and disguises of sight, sound, smell taste and touch, and put on the comfortable robe of mindfulness.¹¹⁴

To properly prepare for meditation, we need to prepare our bodies first. It helps to be clean, and dress simply and comfortably. A healthy light meal once or twice a day with a nourishing drink in between is sufficient. In other words, it is wise to travel light in this journey into inner space. It is very important to learn to sit properly and comfortably right from the start, so that we are stable yet alert in posture.

In due course, we need not think about the bodily posture any more. Once we are able to let go of our physical body, and just let it be, the mind is fully revealed: our inward journey has begun.

Very often, our meditation teachers would instruct us to be so focussed on our breath until it becomes, as it were, the door into our inner space and stillness. But there are many other methods we can use, such as the cultivation of lovingkindness.¹¹⁵

The spiritual friendship of our meditation teacher is vital in having someone wise and compassionate to guide us in this great spiritual adventure. Our most wonderful teacher and spiritual friend is, of course, the Buddha. For, he is the one who has re-discovered dhyana, just as the past Buddhas have done. We will now look deeper into this wonderful discovery. [SD 33.1b]

— — —

¹¹³ See *Nimitta & Anuvyañjana* = SD 19.14.

¹¹⁴ See *Brahmavamso* 2006:116 f.

¹¹⁵ For a full list of meditation methods, see *Bhāvanā* = SD 15.1 (Fig 8.1).

Bibliography

- Adam, Martin T
 2006 “Two concepts of meditation and three kinds of wisdom in Kamalaśīla’s *Bhāvanākramas*: A problem of translation.” *Buddhist Studies Review* 23,1 2006:71-92. Download from <http://web.uvic.ca/pacificasia/faculty/files/AdamBSR.pdf>.
- Analayo [Theodor P Steffens, 1962-]
 2003 *Satipaṭṭhāna: The direct path to realization*. Kandy: Buddhist Publication Society, 2003: 74 f.
- Arbel, Keren
 2008 “Buddhist or Not? Thinking Anew the Role of the Jhanas in the Path of Awakening,” Paper presented in “Buddhism in Asia”: A Day Seminar with Prof Jan Nattier and Prof John McRea, Tel Aviv University, 8 April 2008. [Unpublished.] Conference paper: <http://www.tau.ac.il/humanities/eastasia/events.eng.html>.
- Bodhi, Bhikkhu
 1999 (Abhs:B or Abhs:BRS) *A Comprehensive Manual of Abhidhamma* [1993], ed & tr Bhikkhu Bodhi [based on Pali texts orig ed & tr Mahāthera Nārada, Abhs:N]. Introd & guide by U Rewata Dhamma & Bhikkhu Bodhi. Abhidhamma tables by U Sīlananda. Kandy: Buddhist Publication Society, 2nd ed 1999.
 2000 *The Connected Discourses of the Buddha* (S:B), tr Bhikkhu Bodhi, Boston: Wisdom, 2000. 2 vols. Repr 2002, 1 vol. Barnes, Michael
 1981 “The Buddhist way of deliverance.” *Studia Missionalia* 30 1981:233-277.
- Boisvert, Mathieu
 1995 *The Five Aggregates: Understanding Theravāda psychology and soteriology*. SR Supplements no 17. Waterloo, Ont: Wilfrid Laurier University Press for Canadian Corporation for Studies in Religion, ©1995. Repr Delhi: Sri Satguru Publications (Indian Books Centre), 1997.
- Brahmavamso, Ajahn [Peter Betts, 1951-]
 1998 “Travelogue to the four jhanas.” Ed from a talk during the 9-day retreat, North Perth, Australia. Dec 1997. Download from http://www.dharmaweb.org/index.php/Travelogue_to_the_four_jhanas_by_Ajahn_Brahmavamso or <http://www.buddhanet.net/budsas/ebud/ebmed042.htm>.
 1999 *Basic Buddhist Meditation Practice and the Jhānas*. Kuala Lumpur: Buddhist Gem Fellowship, 1999. Repr in 2005a. http://www.openbase.in.th/files/T_The-Basic.pdf; <http://www.jhanagrove.org.au/meditation.html> & http://www.dharmaweb.org/index.php/The_Basic_Method_of_Meditation_by_Ajahn_Brahmavamso
 2003 *The Jhānas*. Singapore: Buddhist Fellowship, 2003 [BE 3546]. Free booklet. Repr in *Basic Buddhist Meditation Practice and the Jhānas*, 2005 (second half). 2003:53 ff (ch 13). http://www.what-buddha-taught.net/Books/Ajahn_Brahm_The_Jhanas.htm.
 2005a *Basic Buddhist Meditation Practice and the Jhānas*. Singapore: Buddhist Fellowship, 2005a: (1) “The basic method of meditation” [1999]; (2) “The Jhānas.”
 2005b “Bāhiya’s Teaching: In the seen is just the seen.” Talk to the monks at Bodhinyana Monastery, 29 May 2005:5-7. http://www.bswa.org/audio/documents/BodhinyanaTalk_09.pdf.
 2006 *Mindfulness, Bliss and Beyond: A meditator’s handbook*. Boston: Wisdom Publications, 2006:127-130. (Review by Piya Tan: <http://dharmafarer.googlepages.com>).
- Bronkhorst, Johannes
 2000 “The Riddle of the Jainas and the Ājīvikas in early Buddhist literature.” *Journal of Indian Philosophy* 28,5-6 2000:511-529. Download from: http://my.unil.ch/serval/document/BIB_14B1B6FB3BFC.pdf.
- Brough, John

- 1962 [Dh:G(B)] *The Gāndhāri Dharmapada*, tr John Brough. London, Oxford University Press, 1962.
- Bucknell, Roderick S
1993 “Reinterpreting the Jhānas.” *Journal of the International Association of Buddhist Studies* 16,2 1993:375-409.
- Cousins, LS
1992 “Vitakka/vitarka and vicāra: stages of samādhi in Buddhism and Yoga.” *Indo-Iranian Journal* 35, 1992:137-157.
2009 “Scholar monks and meditator monks revisited.” In John Powers & Charles S Prebish (eds), *Destroying Mārea Forever: Buddhist ethics essays in honor of Damien Keown*, Ithaca, NY: Snow Lionm 2009:31-46.
- Crangle, Edward Fitzgerald
1994 *The Origin and Development of Early Indian Contemplative Practices*. Studies in Oriental Religions vol 29. Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz Verlag, 1994. xii, 314 p; 24 cm.
- Eden, Philip M
1984 “The Jhānas,” *Middle Way* 59,2 1984:87-90.
- Ency Bsm = Encyclopaedia of Buddhism
1996 ↓Karunaratne, Upali.
- Fryba, Mirko
1987 *The Art of Happiness: Teachings of Buddhist Psychology*. Boston: Shambhala, 1987. Repr 1989.
- Gethin, Rupert M
1986 “The five Khandhas: their treatment in the Nikāyas and early Abhidhamma.” *Dordrecht, Journal of Indian Philosophy* 14 1986:35-53.
2001 *The Path to Awakening: A study of the Bodhi-pakkhiyā Dhammā*. [EJ Brill, 1992.] 2nd ed Oxford: Oneworld Publications, 2001:180-183.
- Griffiths, Paul
1981 “Concentration or insight: The problematic of Theravāda Buddhist meditation-theory.” *The Journal of the American Academy of Religions* 49,4 1981:605-624.
1994 *On Being Buddha: The classical doctrine of Buddhahood*, Albany, NY: State Univ of NY Press, 1994.
- Gunaratana, Henepola
1985 *The Path of Serenity and Insight: An explanation of the Buddhist Jhānas*. Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1985.
1988 *The Jhānas in Theravāda Buddhist Meditation*. *Access to Insight*, May 6, 2010, <http://www.accesstoinsight.org/lib/authors/gunaratana/wheel351.html>.
2007 “Should we come out of Jhāna to practice Vipassanā?” High View, VW: Bhavana Society, 2007. Download from: http://www.bhavanasociety.org/resource/should_we_come_out_of_jhana_to_practice_vipassana/.
2009 “The Jhanas: In Theravada Buddhist Meditation.” *Access to Insight*, 7 June 2009, <http://www.accesstoinsight.org/lib/authors/gunaratana/wheel351.html> or <http://www.accesstoinsight.org/lib/authors/gunaratana/wheel351.html>.
- Harvey, Peter
1995 *The Selfless Mind: Personality, consciousness and Nirvana in early Buddhism*. Richmond: Curzon Press, 1995.
- Kalupahana, David
1992 *A History of Buddhist Philosophy: Continuities and discontinuities*. Honolulu: Univ of Hawaii Press, 1992. Repr Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1994, 2006.
- Karunadasa, Y
1967 *Buddhist Analysis of Matter*. Colombo: Dept of Cultural Affairs, 1967.

- Karunaratne, Upali
1996 “Jhāna.” Colombo: Encyclopaedia of Buddhism, 1996:50-55.
- King, Winston L
1980 *Theravada Meditation: The Buddhist Transformation of Yoga*. University Park, PA: Pennsylvania State University Press, 1980.
- Ledi Sayadaw
1986a *The Buddhist Philosophy of Relations*, tr U Ñāṇa, Kandy: Buddhist Publication Society, 1986.
- Norman, KR
1974a “The Gandhārī version of the Dharmapada.” LS Cousins et al (eds), *Buddhist Studies in Honour of IB Horner*, Dordrecht: D Reidel, 1974:171-180. Repr in *Collected Papers* vol 1, Oxford: Pali Text Soc, 1990:171-180.
- Nyanatiloka Mahathera
1920 *Fundamentals of Buddhism*, Tokyo, 1920. Free download from <http://www.accesstoinsight.org/lib/authors/nyanatiloka/wheel394.html> or PDF <http://www.accesstoinsight.org/lib/authors/nyanatiloka/wheel394.pdf>.
1982 *Path to Deliverance* [1952]. Kandy: Buddhist Publication Soc, 2nd ed 1959; 3rd ed, 3th ed 1982.
- Ott, Julius von
1912 “Das Satipaṭṭhāna Suttaṃ.” *Buddhistische Welt* 6,9-10 1912:346-380.
- Pa Auk Sayadaw
1996 *The Light of Wisdom*. Malaysia: WAVE, 1996. Free booklet.
1999 *Knowing and Seeing: Talks and questions-and-answers at a meditation retreat in Taiwan*. ©WK Ng, 1999. viii + 263 pp. Free book. Some editing & possible tr errors. Various reprs.
- Poussin, Louis de la Vallée
1917 *The Way to Nirvana: Six lectures on ancient Buddhism as a discipline of salvation*. Hibbert lectures, Manchester College, Oxford, Feb-Apr 1916. Cambridge: Cambridge Univ Press, 1917. Free download from: <http://www.archive.org/details/thewaytonirvana00lavauoft>.
- Rhys Davids, (Mrs) CAF
1974 *A Buddhist Manual of Psychological Ethics* [Dhamma,saṅgaṇī tr 1900], London: Pali Text Society, 2nd ed 1923; 3rd ed 1974.
- Schmithausen, Lambert
1981 “On some aspects of descriptions or theories of ‘Liberating insight’ and enlightenment in early Buddhism,” in *Studien zum Jainismus und Buddhismus: Gedenschrift für Ludwig Alsdorf*, ed Klaus Bruhn & Albrecht Wezler, Wiesbaden: Steiner, 1981:199-250.
- Shwe Zan Aung & CAF Rhys Davids
1915 *Points of Controversy* [*Kathā,vatthu* tr], London: Pali Text Society, 1979. Repr 1979.
- Stuart-Fox, Martin
1989 “Jhāna and Buddhist scholasticism,” *Journal of the International Association of Buddhist Studies* 12,2 1989:79-110.
- Sujato Bhikkhu
2005b *A History of Mindfulness: How insight worsened tranquility in the Satipatthana Sutta*. Free book by the Corporate Body of the Buddha Educational Foundation, Taipei, Taiwan (<http://www.budaedu.org>). Bundanoon: Santi Forest Monastery, 2005. Also accessible as pdf from <http://santifm1.0.googlepages.com/writings.php>.
2005c *A History of Mindfulness: How insight worsened tranquility in the Satipatthana Sutta*. PDF. Bundanoon: Santi Forest Monastery, 2005. Download from <http://sites.google.com/site/santipada/bhantesujato%27swork#books>
- Sujiva Bhikkhu
1996 “Access & Fixed Concentration” *Vipassanā Tribune* 4,2 1996:6-11.

Velkar, Neela

1969 *Upāsana in the Upaniṣads*. Unpublished PhD thesis, Univ of Bombay, June 1969.

Wynne, Alexander

2003 “How old is the Suttapiṭaka?” Oxford: St John’s College, 2003. Accessible from <http://www.ocbs.org/research/Wynne.pdf>.

2007 *The Origin of Buddhist Meditation*. Routledge Critical Studies in Buddhism. London: Routledge, 2007.

100421; 100505; 100608