

Udumbarikā Sīhanāda Sutta

The Discourse on the Lion-roar at Udumbarikā

[The Buddha pays back a zealot in his own coins]
(Dīgha Nikāya 25/3:36-57)

1 Introduction

1.1 TREE SIMILE. At the Udumbarikā Wanderers’ Park, the wanderer Nigrodha boasts that he could “knock the recluse Gotama over like an empty pot” with a single question. The Buddha answers his challenge in a most unexpected way—by going along with the wanderer Nigrodha’s train of thoughts—that ultimately points to “the heartwood” or pith of the teaching.

The Buddha employs the delightful set of similes in reference to the parts of a tree. The full sequence of the tree simile comprises:

- (1) the loose outer bark (*papaṭika*), ie crust or pieces of dry bark that flake off [§15b]; this word also translates as “shoots, sprouts”;
- (2) the bark (*taca*) [§17b], lit “skin”;
- (3) the sapwood (*pheggu*) [§18c], ie the layer surrounding the pith,
- (4) the heartwood (*sāra*) [§19c] (lit “essence”), ie the core or pith,¹ and
- (5) the root (*mūla*).

In all the passages² these similes are found, the various parts are always contrasted with the pith (*sāra*).

1.2 HUMOUR AND TOLERANCE. This sutta is a good example of early Buddhist humour. It is also an important document on the Buddhist tolerance of other faiths and as such serves as an excellent platform for interfaith dialogue.

1.3 KEY WORDS. This sutta has been translated by T.W. Rhys Davids (1921) [D:RD] and by Maurice Walshe (1995) [D:W]. It contains some challenging Pali words like *go,kaṇṇa* (n7), *ācariyaka* (n8), *adhi,jeguccha* (n9) and *tapa,jeguccha* (n11), most of which have here been differently translated from those of T.W. Rhys Davids and of Maurice Walshe.

KP Jain, in his article, “The Jaina References in the Buddhist Literature” (1926), points out that the practices of “**asceticism of loathsomeness**” (*tapo,jugucchā*) [§8] are actually the rules of the Jain recluses (*munī*). If this were the case, then Nigrodha and the wandering ascetics (or at least Nigrodha) in the Udumbarikā Wanderers’ Park were actually Jain.

2 The Buddha’s challenge

2.1 A UNIVERSAL TEACHING. The Udumbarikā Sīhanāda Sutta contains one of the most important statements on **Buddhist missiology**, that is, the seven statements [§23] towards the end of the Sutta, namely:³

- (1) “Let whoever is your teacher (*ācariya*) remain as your teacher.”
- (2) “Let your training (*uddesa*) remain as your training.”
- (3) “Let your livelihood (*ājīva*) remain as your livelihood.”
- (4) “Let what you consider unwholesome (*akusala*) continue to be so considered.”
- (5) “Let what you consider wholesome (*kusala*) continue to be so considered.”
- (6) **There are unabandoned unwholesome states that conduce to rebirth and future suffering.**

¹ “Heartwood,” *sāra*, ie, the core or essence of anything; the pith or the best of wood—a simile for spiritual strength and attainment. See **Madhu,piṇḍika S** (M 18.12/1:111) = SD 6.14. Here, the Buddha’s humour is evident in such a simile given in the latter (D 25.15-19/3:47-53) = 1.4). In (**Saṅgha**) **Uposatha S** (A 4.190.1b/2:182) = SD 15.10b, *sāra* means “essence,” in the sense of accomplished in moral virtue, etc (AA 3:168).

² See D 3:51; M 1:192 f; S 4:168; A 1:152, 2:10 = Pug 52; A 3:20; cf M 1:488 where a slightly more elaborate version—incl branches and leaves—is used by Vacchagotta.

³ For an interpretation in the context of *papañca*, see SD 19.1(7.3-7.4).

(7) “By your own insight and realization, you will attain the fullness of wisdom.”

Let me comment on each of these seven points [7.3] as I understand them to be so in the Buddha’s time, and in a manner applicable to our own times.

(1) We can keep to our religious discipleship or academic training; or, we need not give up our religion or academic training to practise the Buddha’s teachings. Even after some followers of other religions converted to Buddhism, the Buddha encouraged them to continue to respect and even support their erstwhile teachers. The best known case is that of the householder Upāli of Nālandā, ex-follower of the Jain teacher, Nigaṇṭha Nātaputta. The Buddha admonishes him, “Householder, long indeed has your family supported the Nirgranthas, and please consider that almsfood should still be given to them when they come.”⁴

(2) We can continue keeping to training or rules we have been observing, or are used to, while we are practising the Buddha’s teachings. The Buddha is not interested in religious identities, or parallels, or similarities, especially where *language* (words, thoughts and expression) is the basis of such systems. There are moral and spiritual issues that you will realize that are beyond our comprehension and capacity to resolve: only spiritual liberation can transcend such worldly failures.

(3) We do not need to give up our occupation or means of supporting ourselves. We need some kind of suitable livelihood to support ourselves and others. The more conducive our livelihood is for spiritual development, the easier it is for us to understand the true purpose and efficacy of the Buddha Dharma. Often enough, the light of the Buddha’s truth is so penetrating that we see through our own lifestyles, and realize what to do about it, to take that next step up the spiral path to spiritual liberation.

(4) We need not change your opinions regarding what is good. Whatever notion of good that we may have, understandably reflects our own understanding of self and the world. As we reflect on the profound teachings of the Buddha, that understanding matures into greater insight into true reality.

(5) We need not change our opinions regarding what is evil. Our understanding of what is unwholesome or evil is often based on past pains and present conditioning. When we begin to see the universality of such pains and lack as the Buddha has experienced them, we begin to connect to a larger reality, so that our pains flower into compassion and our confusion becomes wisdom.

Religion, education, profession, philosophies and morals—as the above five are—are all secondary to spiritual development. We can have all these five things at their best, but we may still lack spiritual wisdom and liberation. Indeed, these are the very things that could be holding us back from being better than what we are right now. How often these self-approved systems are actually the result of comparing ourselves with others, and defining happiness as *having* things (wealth, status, power, pleasure), instead of truly *being* happy.

(6) There are unabandoned unwholesome states that conduce to rebirth and future suffering. In others, there is still a missing piece in our life’s puzzle, a vital piece that often eludes us as we are distracted by the religion of words, wealth, status, power, and pleasure. How often we are goaded on mostly by the fear of loss, the promise of power, the comfort of other-love, or the dependence on pleasure. All that we have really achieved is only a sense of a very private limited self-fulfillment.

Even after having gained all this, we may find the costs are very high and we are still utterly hollow. We wish for some inner stillness, but find ourselves again and again caught up by the storm around us. Sometimes we think we have found something strong and meaningful to hold on to, but the force of the storm is too strong, and we get sucked into the maddening maelstrom again. This seems to be endless.

(7) “By your own insight and realization, you will attain the fullness of wisdom.” We are not able to realize our true goodness, especially when we are always seeking the limelight, the bright lights, of the perceived success of others. Like moths, we mistake the candle for the sun, but the candle still burns and kills. But like Prometheus being punished from bringing fire to the world, we are burned again and again by the flame, moment after moment, life after life. It is all so boringly familiar.

⁴ *Dīgha, rattam kho te gah, apati nigaṇṭhānam opāna, bhūtam kulam, yena nesam upagatānam piṇḍakam dātābham maññeyyāsi ti.* See **Upāli S** (M 56.17/1:379) = SD 27.1.

In the dazzling lights of worldly success, we see our shadows darkly cast on the ground. Our shadows are darkest when the lights are brightest. But these are the light of others, and the shadows are false, they are not really us. When we look within, we truly see that the brightest light is right there, ready to shine out from our hearts when the hindrances are removed. This light casts no shadow, but illuminating of true reality.

On a higher level, the Buddha is declaring that he is not teaching a new religion, but a universal spirituality that underlies any religious teaching worth its salt. It does not matter what religion we follow, or that we have no religion at all, we will in due course be confronted with true realities of life pointing to the fact there is something seriously missing in our lives despite everything. We can choose to ignore this vision, or rationalize it away with what we know or do not know, or find someone to interpret it, handing over our remote control to him.

Or, we can take up the Buddha's challenge, and look within ourselves for inner peace and light. For, the Buddha declares,

If you practise accordingly, these defiled states will be abandoned, the states that purify will increase, and by your direct knowledge, you will realize, here and now, the bountiful perfection of wisdom. [§23]

2.2 THE BUDDHA'S LION-ROAR. The **Udumbarika Sīha,nāda Sutta** (D 25) is special in that it is a discourse on the Buddha's own lion-roar (*siha,nāda*). The Majjhima Commentary says that a lion-roar is a statement of supremacy and fearlessness, one that cannot be debunked. Two other related discourses that refer to the lion and his roar, in connection with the Buddha's teaching are **the (Anicca) Siha Sutta** (A 4.33) and **the (Dasaka) Sīha,nāda Sutta** (A 10.21).⁵

The (Kassapa) Mahā Sīhanāda Sutta (D 8) defines it thus: "The ascetic Gotama roars his lion-roar in company and confidently, they question and he answers, he wins them over with his answers, they find it pleasing and are satisfied with what they have heard, they show that they are satisfied, they practise for the sake of realizing true reality, and they are satisfied with the practice" (D 8.22/1:175).

The Buddha specifically defines the "lion-roar" as the declaration that the four types of saints are found only in his Teaching.⁶ The most elaborate lion-roars are those given by the Buddha himself in reply to the naked ascetic Kassapa's question on asceticism (D 8) and in reply to Sunakkhatta's accusation that he lacked spiritual powers (M 12).

Other disciples have also made lion-roars: Mahā Kassapa on his ascetic forest practice, as recorded in **the Mahā Gosiṅga Sutta** (M 32)⁷ and Sāriputta on his faith in the Buddha (D 16.1.16-17 = 28.1). In the late **Cakkavatti Sīha,nāda S**, a lion-roar is made by the royal sage, admonishing to the king to become an "arya wheel-turner," that is, a just king (D 26.5/3:61).

The monk who is foremost amongst lion-roarer is **Piṇḍola Bhāradvāja**, due to his readiness to answer the questions of any doubting monks.⁸ On his attaining arhathood, knowing that whatever a disciple needs to attain has been attained by him, he roars his lion-roar before the Buddha himself, "Let those who have any doubt in the path and fruition [the stages of sainthood] question me!" (ApA 300)⁹

⁵ Respectively A 4.33/2:33 f = S 22.78/3:84-86 (SD 42.10) & A 10.21/5:32-36 = SD 81.2.

⁶ D 16.5.27/2:152; M 11.2/1:64 f.

⁷ M 32.7/1:214; see also S 16.5/2:202.

⁸ A 1:23; AA 1:197 f; ApA 300; ThaA 2:3 f. See **Piṇḍola Bhāradvāja** = SD 27.6a(1.2).

⁹ On this pre-eminence, A 1:23; SA 2:393; AA 1:199; ThaA 2:4; UA 252; J 4:263.

The Discourse on the Lion-roar at Udumbarikā

(D 25/3:36-57)

[36] 1 Thus have I heard.

Sandhāna

¹⁰At one time the Blessed One was staying on the Vulture’s Peak near Rājagaha. At that time the wanderer Nigrodha was staying at the Udumbarikā Wanderers’ Park¹¹ with a large company of some three thousand wanderers.

At dawn, the householder **Sandhāna**¹² came to Rājagaha to see the Blessed One. Then he thought:

“It is not the proper time to see the Blessed One since he is still in retreat. It is also not the proper time to see the monks worthy of esteem,¹³ since these esteemed monks, too, are still in retreat. Perhaps I should go to the Udumbarikā Wanderers’ Park and call on the wanderer Nigrodha.”

And he went there.

The wanderers

2 Now at that time the wanderer Nigrodha was sitting with a large crowd of wanderers who were all talking loudly, shouting, making loud noises, and indulging in various **low talk**,¹⁴ that is to say, talk about kings, robbers, [37] ministers of state; about armies, dangers, and wars; about food and drink; about clothing, beds [furniture], garlands, and scents; about relatives; about vehicles; about villages, towns, cities, the countryside; about women and heroes; gossips of the street and at the well; tales of the dead; tales of diversity [philosophical discussions of the past and future], talk about the creation of the world and of the sea, and talk of whether things exist or not [or, talk about gain and loss].¹⁵

3 Then the wanderer Nigrodha saw the householder Sandhāna approaching from a distance, and he called his own company of followers to order, saying:

“Good sirs, be quiet please! Don’t make a noise, good sirs! The householder Sandhāna, a follower of the recluse Gotama, is approaching. He is one of those white-dressed lay disciples¹⁶ of the recluse Gotama

¹⁰ §§1-3 parallel **Samaṇa,maṇḍikā S** (M 78.1-3/2:22 f) = SD 18.9.

¹¹ *Udumbarikā paribbājak’ārāma*. This park belonged to queen Udumbarikā who dedicated to the wanderers for their use. Nearby was the Peacocks’ Feeding Ground (*mora,nivāpa*) beside the Sumāgadhā lotus tank (DA 3:835), both of which were part of the Bamboo Forest (*Velu,vana*).

¹² According to Buddhaghosa (DA 3:832), Sandhāna was the leader of 500 laymen and was a non-returner. The Aṅguttara lists him amongst the foremost lay disciples who have six qualities: faith in the Buddha, faith in the Dharma, faith in the Sangha, noble virtue, noble knowledge, noble release. (A 3:451; cf Divyāvadāna 546)

¹³ “Worthy of esteem” and “esteemed,” *mano,bhāvanīyā* or *-bhāvanīyā*, often used in apposition with *bhikkhū* (D 2:140; M 2:23, 3:36, 3:261; S 3:1, 5:369, 371; A 3:317-322, 5:185, 189; Vv 34.13/49; Miln 129); used of the Buddha, *mano,bhāvanīyaṃ buddhaṃ*, at **Sovaṇṇa,kattarika Ap** (Ap 427.1/2:389). SA comments that “those great elders such as Sāriputta and Moggallāna are called ‘worthy of esteem because the mind grows in wholesome qualities whenever they are seen’” (SA 2:249 f). See DA 3:832; MA 3:17, 266. **Bodhi** notes that “the expression is a gerundive meaning literally ‘who should be brought to mind,’ ie who are worthy of esteem” (S:B 1043 n2). **Sadda,-nīti** (Dhātu,mālā), however, gives both meanings of *mano,bhāvanīya*: (1) one who is worthy of being greeted and asked after his health; (2) one who develops his mind (Sadd:Be 330).

¹⁴ *Tiracchāna,kathā*, lit animal talk. As animals mostly walk parallel to the earth, so this kind of talk does not lead on upwards. This section is *mutatis mutandis* as at **Poṭṭhapāda S** (D 9.3/1:178 f). Cf **Lohicca S** (D 1:228). For a fuller list, called “the moralities” (*sīla*), see **Brahmajāla S** (D 1.43-62/1:4-12) = SD 25.2 & Intro (3), & **Sāmañña,phala S** (D 2.43-63/ 1:63-70) = SD 8.10 & Intro (3).

¹⁵ *Iti,bhavābhāva,kathā*, may be rendered as “being and non-being” or as “profit and loss,” but according to Walshe, the philosophical sense (as in Horner and Ñāṇamoli translations of Sandaka S, M 76) is preferable.

¹⁶ Lay follower, *sāvaka gīhi*, lit householder disciple.

in Rājagaha. And these good folks are fond of quiet; they are taught to be quiet and speak in praise of quiet. If he sees that this company is quiet, he will most likely want to come and visit us.”

When this was said, the wanderers fell silent.

4 Then the householder Sandhāna approached the wanderer Nigrodha and exchanged courtesies and then sat down at one side. Having sat down at one side, the householder Sandhāna said to the wanderer Nigrodha:

“Good sirs, the way those wanderers outside the faith conduct themselves when they assemble is one thing: they make such a great noise [38] and indulge in various low talk...[as in §3]... The Blessed One’s way is different—he resorts to a dwelling in the forest, in the jungle, free from noise, with little sound, alone with the winds,¹⁷ away from humans, conducive for seclusion.”

Nigrodha’s challenge

5 Then the wanderer Nigrodha replied:

“Well now, householder, do you know with whom the recluse Gotama talks? Whom does he converse with? From whom does he find his clarity of wisdom? The recluse Gotama is destroyed by the solitary life. He is awkward in an assembly. He is no good at conversation. Just as a one-eyed cow,¹⁸ walking in circles, keeps to the fringes (of a field): the recluse Gotama is only occupied with the fringes of things. Indeed, householder, if the recluse Gotama were to come to this assembly, we will baffle him with a single question, we will knock him over like an empty pot!”

The Buddha arrives

6 Now the Blessed One with his divine ear faculty, purified and superhuman [reaching beyond the normal human range], heard this exchange between the householder Sandhāna and the wanderer Nigrodha.

And, descending from the Vulture’s Peak, he came to the Sumāgadhā bank beside the Peacocks’ Feeding Ground and [39] walked up and down there in the open.

Then the wanderer Nigrodha saw him and called his company to order, saying:

“Good sirs, be quiet please! Don’t make a noise, good sirs! The recluse Gotama is walking up and down in the open beside the Sumāgadhā Tank. He is fond of quiet, and speaks in praise of quiet. If he sees that this company is quiet, he will surely want to come and visit us. If he does so, we will put this question to him:

‘Bhante, what is the doctrine in which the Blessed One trains his disciples, and which those disciples so trained as to benefit from it as regard their principal support and the fundamentals of the holy life?’”

When this was said, the wanderers fell silent.

7a Then the Blessed One approached the wanderer Nigrodha, who then said:

“Please come, venerable Blessed One! Welcome, venerable Blessed One! It is a long time since the venerable Blessed One has found the occasion to come here.¹⁹ Let the venerable Blessed One take a seat. Here is a seat that has been prepared.”

The Blessed One sat down on the prepared seat, and the wanderer Nigrodha taking a low seat, sat down at one side. Having sat down, the Blessed One said this to him:²⁰

¹⁷ Alone with the winds, *vijana, vatāni*; D:W has “far from the madding crowd.” Cf D:RD 3:35 n1.

¹⁸ *Go, kāṇḍā*; cf *go, kaṇṇa*, “a large species of deer, J 5:406” (PED). D:W has “bison.” D:RD and here follow the Comy. Cf *go, maṇḍala va parinesi* (“led around in a circle like a cow”): see Tha 1143 = SD 20.9.

¹⁹ “Please come,...to come here,” *etu kho bhante Bhagavā svagataṃ bhante Bhagavato, cirassam kho marisā imam pariyāyam akāsi yadidaṃ idh’āgamanāya*, using the 3rd imp sg *etu* (“Let ...come!”) as a polite formality (D 25.7a/3:39); also at **Poṭṭhapāda S** (D 9.5/1:179) = SD 7.14; **Gopaka Moggallāna S** (M 108.4/3:7) = SD 33.5. In the phrase, *pariyāyam akāsi*, “made it an occasion.” In the phrase, *pariyāyam akāsi*, “made it an occasion,” Comy glosses *pariyāya* as *vāra* (“occasion, opportunity”) (UA 115). This is stock: **D** 1:90 (DA 2:369), 179 (see D:RD 1:245 n2), 2:270, 3:2, 39; **M** 1:252 (MA 2:300 f), 326, 481, 2:2, 30, 3:7; **S** 1:142; **A** 3:332 (AA 3:363), 4:76; **U** 13 (UA 115); **J** 3:359. In **Brahma Nimantanika S** (M 49), Baka Brahmā says: *ehi kho marisā, sāgataṃ marisā, cirassam kho marisā imam pariyāyam akāsi yadidaṃ idh’āgamanāya*.

“Nigrodha what is the talk you are having, sitting together here? And what is the conversation that is left unfinished?”²¹

The wanderer Nigrodha replied:

“Bhante, we saw the Blessed One walking up and down exercising his legs²² by the Sumāgadhā Tank at the Peacock’s Feeding Ground, [40] and we thought:

‘If the recluse Gotama were to come here we could ask him this question: Bhante, what is the doctrine that the Blessed One trains his disciples, and which those disciples so trained as to benefit from it regard as their principal support and the fundamentals of the holy life?’

This, bhante, is our conversation that is unfinished when. Then the Blessed One arrived.”

The Buddha’s counter-question

7b “Nigrodha, it is hard for one, holding a different view, keeping different priority, having a different personal preference [under a different influence], keeping to a different practice, following a different teaching,²³ to understand the doctrine that I teach my disciples (regarding their principal support and the fundamentals of the holy life).²⁴

Come on, then, Nigrodha, ask me about your own teachings, about what you regard as loathsome,²⁵ thus:

‘And how, bhante,²⁶ is the asceticism of loathsomeness²⁷ fulfilled, and how is it not fulfilled?’”

When this was said, a great commotion arose amongst the wanderers.²⁸

“It is wonderful, it is marvellous how great the powers and virtues of the recluse Gotama in holding back his own doctrine and in inviting others to discuss theirs!”

8a Silencing them, the wanderer Nigrodha said:

“Bhante, we live by the doctrine of asceticism of loathsomeness, by the essence of asceticism of loathsomeness, by keeping to asceticism of loathsomeness. Such being the case, what constitutes their fulfillment or non-fulfillment?”

²⁰ This episode of the Buddha interrupting a “unfinished conversation” (*antarā,kathā vipakatā*) is stock, eg, D 1.1.4/1:2; D 2.7a/3:39 f; M 119.2/3:89, U 2.2/11.

²¹ *Kāya nu’ttha, bho ānanda, etarahi kathāya sannisinnā, kā ca pana vo antarā,kathā vipakatā ti?* This is stock, where the person interrupting is usu the Buddha, eg, D 1.1.4/1:2; M 108.6/3:8 (the brahmin Vassa,kāra), 119.-2/3:89, U 2.2/11; J 4/1:120

²² “Walking up and down exercising his legs,” *jañghā,vihāraṃ anucaṅkamanāṃ anuvicaramāno*, lit “wandering to and fro on foot and walking up and down” (KR Norman, *Group of Discourses II*, 1992:63).

²³ “Holding a differing view...following different teachings,” *añña,dīṭṭhikena añña,khantikena añña,rucikena aññatr’āyogena aññatr’ācariyakena*. This is stock: **Poṭṭhapāda S** (D 9.24/1:187 x2); **Pāṭhika S** (D 24.2.21/3:35 x2); **Aggi Vaccha,gotta S** (M 72.18/1:487); **Udumbarikā Sīha,nāda S** (D 25.7/3:40); **Vekhanassa S** (M 80.14/2:43). D:W has “holding different views, being of different inclinations and subject to different influences, following a different teacher,” apparently missing *aññatr’āyogena*.

²⁴ Cf Soṇa,daṇḍa’s fear that the Buddha might ask him something beyond his ken: **Soṇa,daṇḍa S** (D 4.11/-1:119) = SD 30.5.

²⁵ *Adhi,jegucche*. lit “regarding what is loathsome” following CPD. D:W has “about your extreme austerity,” following Comy: *uttamaṃ jegucchaṃ* (DA 2:369). See D:RD 3:37 n1.

²⁶ *Bhante*, found in all MSS, but omitted by both D:RD and D:W.

²⁷ *Tapo,jigucchā*, defined as “efforts in the burning (*santāpa*) of the defilements” (*kilesa,santāpaka,viriya*) (DA 2:369). See also D 1:174, 3:40, 42 f, 48 f; A 2:200, 205 ff; DA 3:840. There is a wordplay on *santāpa* which means “burning” and “torture, mortification.” In **Mahā Sīhanāda S** (D 8.21), the Buddha declares that he is supreme in *tapo,jigicchā*—which Walshe tr as “self-mortification and scrupulous austerity”—that is to say “as regards loathsomeness” (*adhijeguccha*) (D 8.21/1:174), Walshe tr as “the super-austerity”: see n on *adhijegucche* above. This is clearly a syn of self-mortification (*attā,kilamathānuyoga*, S 5:421; *dukkara,kiriya*). **Vibhaṅga Mūla Tīkā** in fact says it refers to “mortifying practices such as the five fires, etc” (*pañcātapa,tappan’ādi,dukkara,kiriya*) (Be 106). PED wrongly defines as “disgust for asceticism.” See Intro (1.3).

²⁸ The assembly is amazed probably because the Buddha has proposed to discuss a topic that is at the heart of their training or system.

The Buddha's reply

8b ²⁹“Here, Nigrodha, a (self-mortifying) ascetic³⁰ is one who goes about naked, of loose habits (flouting conventions),³¹

licking his hands;³²

not coming when invited, not stopping when invited. [41]

He does not accept food brought to him nor food specially prepared for him nor a meal invitation.

He accepts nothing from a pot, from a bowl, across a threshold, among the firewood, among the rice-pounders, from two eating together, from a pregnant woman, from a woman giving suck, from a woman in the midst of men,³³ from a food-distribution centre, from where a dog is waiting, from where flies are swarming.³⁴

He accepts neither fish nor meat; drinks no wine nor beer nor rice-wine.³⁵

He keeps himself to one house, to one morsel (when collecting alms)...to two houses, to two morsels ...to seven houses, to seven morsels.

He lives on one small serving (of food), or two...or seven small servings a day.³⁶

He takes food once a day; once every two days...once every seven days. Thus even up to a fortnight, he dwells pursuing the practice of taking of food at such regular intervals.

He is an eater of greens or of millet or of wild rice or of hide-parings or of water-lettuce³⁷ or of rice-bran or of rice-remnants,³⁸ or of sesamum flour, or of grass, or of cow-dung,

He lives on forest roots and fruits, a windfall-eater.

He clothes himself in hemp; in hemp-mixed cloth; in shrouds;³⁹ in refuse rags; in tree bark; in antelope hide; in strips of antelope hide; in kusa-grass fabric; in bark fabric; in wood-shaving fabric; in a human-hair cloak; in animal wool; in owl's wings.

He pulls out (his) hair and beard, [42] and is devoted to this practice.

He stands continuously, rejecting seats.

He squats continuously, and is devoted to such a posture.

He uses a bed of spikes, making it his bed.

²⁹ This whole section is, mutatis mutandis, at **Kassapa Sīha,nāda S** (D 8.14/1:165-167 = SD 77.1) = **Udumbarikā Sīha,nāda S** (D 25.8b/3:41 = SD 1.4), with 6 additional observances) = **Mahā Sīha,nāda S** (M 12.45/1:77 f = SD 49.1) = **Kandaraka S** (M 51.8/1:342 f = SD 32.9) = **Apaṇṇaka S** (M 60.36/1:412 = SD 35.5, with 6 additional observances) = **Ghoṭa,mukha S** (M 94.10/2:161 = SD 77.2) = **Paṭipadā Acela S** (A 3.141/1:295) = **Atta,daṇḍa Sutta Nd** (Nm 15/416 f).

³⁰ Ascetic (*tapassī*), ie, one who practises *tapa*, religious austerities or self-mortification. Here, prob a Jain ascetic is meant. See prec n.

³¹ *Mutt'ācāro*.

³² *Haṭṭhāpalekhano*. Cf Sekh 52 (V 4:98) which proscribes hand-licking; D 1:166, 3:40; M 1:77, 238, 307; A 1:295; Pug 55.

³³ *Puris'antara'gatā*. This phrase is used to define *gihi,gata*, “gone to a householder” (V 4:322); defines *itthi*, “woman” at MA 2:209, DA 78. Comys say that this is a danger to their pleasure (as such putting the ascetic at a disadvantage).

³⁴ *So na kumbhī,mukhā paṭiggaṇhāti, na kaḷopi,mukhā paṭiggaṇhāti, na eḷakam-antaram, na daṇḍam-antaram, na musalam-antaram, na dvinnam bhuñjamānānam, na gabbhiniyā, na pāyamānāya, na puris'antara,gatāya, na saṅkittisu, na yattha sā upaṭṭhito hoti, na yattha makkhikā saṇḍa,saṇḍa,cārinī*.

³⁵ “Rice-wine,” *thus'odaka*, lit “rice chaff.” My tr is contextual and following Comy; M:ÑB has “fermented brew.” See D:RD 1:229 n2, D:W n196.

³⁶ “Small serving,” *datti*. Comy says that a *datti* is a small bowlful from which they leave out the main food (MA 2:45).

³⁷ “Water-lettuce,” *haṭa*, a kind of water-plant, *Pistia stratiotes* (PED) of the Arales order.

³⁸ “Rice-remnants,” *ācāma*, “the moisture of boiled rice, rice-scum, rice-water (without condiments, a mean unsavoury food—hence, prob interpreted as the burnt crust sticking to the pot” (CPD): DA 356,15 = MA 2:45,12 = AA 2:355,17 = PugA 232,25; ie “burnt rice remnants in a pot,” or “kerak nasi” in Malay.

³⁹ Shrouds collected from corpses in a charnel ground.

⁴⁰ *He makes a plank his bed.*

He makes the hard stony ground his bed.

He lies on one side only covered in dirt and mud.

He lies in the open on whatever groundsheet there is.

He lives on dirt, devoting himself to eating dirt.

He does not drink (cold water), devoting himself to not drinking (cold water).⁴¹

He engages in (the ritual of) bathing in water three times a day, the third one in the evening.⁴²

—What do you think, Nigrodha, is the asceticism of loathsomeness fulfilled or not?”

“Indeed, bhante, it is fulfilled.”

“But, Nigrodha, this asceticism of loathsomeness has various imperfections, I say!”

Imperfections of the asceticism of loathsomeness

9 “In what way, bhante, does the Blessed One say that it has various imperfections?”

(1) “Here, Nigrodha, an ascetic practises austerity. As a result, he rejoices thinking that he has won his goal.

Nigrodha, that an ascetic practises austerity, and rejoices thinking that he has won his goal (when he has not)—this, Nigrodha, is an imperfection in that ascetic.

(2) Furthermore, Nigrodha, an ascetic practises austerity. In so doing, he elevates himself and disparages others.

Nigrodha, that he is an ascetic who practises austerity, who elevates himself and disparages others—this, too, Nigrodha, is an imperfection in that ascetic.

(3) Furthermore, Nigrodha, an ascetic practises austerity. In so doing, Nigrodha, he becomes intoxicated with conceit, infatuated and heedless. Nigrodha, that an ascetic is intoxicated with conceit, [43] infatuated and heedless—this, too, Nigrodha, is a fault in the ascetic.

10 (4) Furthermore, Nigrodha, an ascetic practises austerity, and this brings him gains, honours and fame. On account of such gains, honours and fame, he rejoices, thinking he has won his goal.

Nigrodha, that an ascetic practises austerity, and this brings him gains, honours and fame, as a result of which he thinks he has won his goal—this, too, Nigrodha, is a fault in the ascetic.

(5) Furthermore, Nigrodha, an ascetic practises austerity, and this brings him gains, honours and fame. On account of such gains, honours and fame, he elevates himself and disparages others.

Nigrodha, that he is an ascetic practising austerity, and this brings him gains, honours and fame, and on account of such gains, honours and fame, he elevates himself and disparages others—this, too, Nigrodha, is a fault in the ascetic.

(6) Furthermore, Nigrodha, an ascetic practises austerity, and this brings him gains, honours and fame. On account of such gains, honours and fame, he is intoxicated with conceit, infatuated and heedless.

Nigrodha, that an ascetic practises austerity, and this brings him gains, honours and fame, and on account of such gains, honours and fame, he is intoxicated with conceit, infatuated and heedless—this, too, Nigrodha, is a fault in the ascetic.

(7) Furthermore, Nigrodha, an ascetic practises austerity, and he divides his food into two portions, thinking: ‘This portion suits me, that doesn’t suit me!’ And what does not suit him he readily rejects, while what suits him he eats with relish,⁴³ unaware of the danger, knowing no way out.

⁴⁰ Practices listed from here until “devoting himself to not drinking (cold water)” are not listed elsewhere in M stock passage.

⁴¹ *Apānaka*, lit “non-drinker.” I follow Walshe in the amplification. This practice probably refers to those who (like the Jain monks) do not drink cold water because of living beings in it. (D:W n200).

⁴² Apparently to wash away his sins as related in **Saṅgārava S** (S 7.21/1:183). This whole passage [§8b] is at **Apāṇaka S** (M 60.36/1:412) = SD 35.5, where this last sentence is replaced by “This is called the person who torments himself and is intent on tormenting himself.” (M 60.36/1:412)

⁴³ Read *ajjhopanno* (see CPD), “being addicted to, being enthralled by,” (to enjoy doing something) with relish. PTS has *ajjhāpanna*, “with guilt,” guiltily.

Nigrodha, that an ascetic practises austerity, and he divides his food into two portions, thinking: ‘This portion suits me, that doesn’t suit me!’ And what does not suit him he readily rejects, while what suits him he eats with relish, unaware of the danger, knowing no way out—this, too, Nigrodha, is a fault in that ascetic. [44]

(8) Furthermore, Nigrodha, an ascetic practises austerity for the sake of gains, honours and fame, thinking:

‘Kings, ministers, nobles, brahmins, householders, religious teachers will honour me’—this, too, Nigrodha, is a fault in that ascetic.

11 (9) Furthermore, Nigrodha, an ascetic disparages some recluse or brahmin, saying: ‘See how he lives in abundance, eating all sorts of things—that is to say, these five parts of a plant, namely, roots, stems, joints, cuttings, and seeds⁴⁴—with that bunch of lightnings, that jawful razor-teeth, of his,⁴⁵ and they call *him* an ascetic!’

Nigrodha, that an ascetic disparages some recluse or brahmin, saying: ‘See how he lives in abundance, eating all sorts of things—that is to say, these five parts of a plant, namely, roots, stems, joints, cuttings, and seeds—with that bunch of lightnings, that jawful razor-teeth, of his, and they call *him* an ascetic!’—this, too, Nigrodha, is a fault in that ascetic.

(10) Furthermore, Nigrodha, an ascetic sees another recluse or brahmin being patronized, honoured, respected, worshipped amongst families, and he thinks: ‘They are patronizing that fellow named so-and-so, living in abundance, being patronized, honoured, respected, worshipped amongst families, but they do not patronize, honour, respect, worship me, an ascetic who live a rough life!’ Thus envy and jealousy would arise in him because of those householders.

Nigrodha, that an ascetic sees another recluse or brahmin being patronized, honoured, respected, worshipped amongst families, and he thinks: ‘They are patronizing that fellow named so-and-so, living in abundance, being patronized, honoured, respected, worshipped amongst families, but they do not patronize, honour, respect, worship me, an ascetic who live a rough life!’ Thus envy and jealousy would arise in him because of those householders. Furthermore, an ascetic sits in a prominent position—this, too, Nigrodha, is a fault in that ascetic.

(11) Furthermore, Nigrodha, an ascetic is one who sits before the people in public.⁴⁶ Nigrodha, that an ascetic is one who sits before the people in public—this, too, Nigrodha, is a fault in that ascetic.

(12) Furthermore, an ascetic goes about ostentatiously⁴⁷ among the families, as if to say: ‘Look at this asceticism of mine! Look at this asceticism of mine!’

Nigrodha, that an ascetic goes about ostentatiously among the families, as if to say: ‘Look at this asceticism of mine! Look at this asceticism of mine!’—this, too, Nigrodha, is a fault in that ascetic. [45]

(13) Furthermore, an ascetic resorts to underhand conduct. On being asked: ‘Do you approve of this?’, when he does not approve, he says, ‘I do’, or when he does approve, he says, ‘I do not’. In this way, he becomes a conscious liar.

Nigrodha, that an ascetic resorts to underhand conduct, on being asked: ‘Do you approve of this?’, when he does not approve, he says, ‘I do’, or when he does approve, he says, ‘I do not’; in this way, he becomes a conscious liar—this, too, Nigrodha, is a fault in that ascetic.

12a (14) Furthermore, an ascetic, when the Tathāgata or a Tathāgata’s disciple presents the Dharma in a way that deserves his assent, withholds his assent. This, too, Nigrodha, is a fault in that ascetic.

⁴⁴ Cf Brahmajāla S where the Buddha states that he does not destroy plants propagated from any of these five (D 1.1.11).

⁴⁵ “With that bunch of lightnings...of his,” *asani, cakkam danta, kūṭam*.

⁴⁶ “Who sits facing the people in view of everyone” (*āpātha, nisādi*). Comy explains that he sits in full view of others, where he executes the bat-rite (*vagguli, vata*), hanging himself upside down, like a bat (cf J 1:493, 3:235, 4:299); practising the fivefold fires (*pañc’ātāpa*) (he sit in the midst of four blazing fires with the sun as the fifth fire); stands on one leg; or worships the sun (DA 3:838).

⁴⁷ There are difficulties with *adassayamāno* (which D:RD renders as “furtively”). The Sub-Comy, according to D:W, explains its meaning as *ādassamāno* (“showing off”). I follow D:W here.

(15) Furthermore, an ascetic is angry and ill-tempered. Nigrodha, that an ascetic is angry and ill-tempered—this, too, Nigrodha, is a fault in that ascetic.

(16) Furthermore, an ascetic is mean and spiteful. Nigrodha, that an ascetic is mean and spiteful—this, too, Nigrodha, is a fault in that ascetic.

An ascetic is envious and jealous. Nigrodha, that an ascetic is envious and jealous—this, too, Nigrodha, is a fault in that ascetic.

An ascetic is crafty and deceitful. Nigrodha, that an ascetic is crafty and deceitful—this, too, Nigrodha, is a fault in that ascetic.

An ascetic is obstinate and proud. Nigrodha, that an ascetic is obstinate and proud—this, too, Nigrodha, is a fault in that ascetic.

An ascetic has evil desires and is under their sway. Nigrodha, that an ascetic has evil desires and is under their sway—this, too, Nigrodha, is a fault in that ascetic.

An ascetic holds wrong views and given to extreme opinions. Nigrodha, that an ascetic holds wrong views and given to extreme opinions—this, too, Nigrodha, is a fault in that ascetic.

An ascetic is never stuck in self-view, firmly holding on to it, unable to let it go. Nigrodha, that an ascetic is never stuck in self-view, firmly holding on to it, unable to let it go—this, too, Nigrodha, is a fault in that ascetic.

12b What do you think, Nigrodha: are these things imperfections in the asceticism of loathsomeness or not?”

“Certainly they are, bhante. It is possible, bhante, that a certain ascetic might have all these imperfections, what is there to say of any other!”

The purified ascetic

13 (1) Here, Nigrodha, an ascetic practises austerity. As a result, he does not rejoice when he has not won his goal.

Nigrodha, that an ascetic practises austerity, but does not rejoice [46] when he has not won his goal—to that extent he is purified.

(2) Furthermore, Nigrodha, an ascetic practises austerity. In so doing, he elevates himself and disparages others.

Nigrodha, that an ascetic practises austerity, but does not elevate himself and disparages others—to that extent he is purified.

(3) Furthermore, Nigrodha, an ascetic practises austerity, but is not intoxicated with conceit, nor infatuated, nor heedless.

Nigrodha, that an ascetic is not intoxicated with conceit, nor infatuated, nor heedless—to that extent he is purified.

(4) Furthermore, Nigrodha, an ascetic practises austerity, and this brings him gains, honours and fame, but on account of such gains, honours and fame, he rejoices not, thinking he has won his goal.

Nigrodha, that an ascetic practises austerity, and this brings him gains, honours and fame, as a result of which he thinks not that he has won his goal—to that extent he is purified.

(5) Furthermore, Nigrodha, an ascetic practises austerity, and this brings him gains, honours and fame. On account of such gains, honours and fame, he does not elevate himself nor disparages others.

Nigrodha, that he is an ascetic practising austerity which brings him gains, honours and fame, and on account of such gains, honours and fame, he does not elevate himself nor disparages others—to that extent he is purified.

(6) Furthermore, Nigrodha, an ascetic practises austerity, and this brings him gains, honours and fame. On account of such gains, honours and fame, he is not intoxicated with conceit, nor infatuated, nor heedless.

Nigrodha, that an ascetic practises austerity, which brings him gains, honours and fame, but on account of such gains, honours and fame, he is not intoxicated with conceit, nor infatuated, nor heedless—to that extent he is purified.

(7) Furthermore, Nigrodha, an ascetic practises austerity, but does not divide his food into two portions, thinking: ‘This portion suits me, that doesn’t suit me!’ so that what does not suit him, he readily rejects, while what suits him he eats with relish,⁴⁸ unaware of the danger, knowing no way out.

Nigrodha, that an ascetic practises austerity, but does not divide his food into two portions, thinking: ‘This portion suits me, that doesn’t suit me!’ so that what does not suit him, he readily rejects, while what suits him he eats with relish, unaware of the danger, knowing no way out—to that extent he is purified.

(8) Furthermore, Nigrodha, an ascetic practises austerity not for the sake of gains, honours and fame, thinking:

‘Kings, ministers, nobles, brahmins, householders, religious teachers will honour me’—to that extent he is purified.

14 (9) Furthermore, Nigrodha, an ascetic does not disparage some recluse or brahmin, saying: ‘See how he lives in abundance, eating all sorts of things—that is to say, these five parts of a plant, namely, roots, stems, joints, cuttings, and seeds—with that bunch of lightnings, that jawful razor-teeth, of his, and they call *him* an ascetic!’

Nigrodha, that an ascetic does not disparage some recluse or brahmin, saying:

[47] ‘See how he lives in abundance, eating all sorts of things—that is to say, these five parts of a plant, namely, roots, stems, joints, cuttings, and seeds—with that bunch of lightnings, that jawful razor-teeth, of his, and they call *him* an ascetic!’—to that extent he is purified.

(10) Furthermore, Nigrodha, an ascetic sees another recluse or brahmin being patronized, honoured, respected, worshipped amongst families, but does not think: ‘They are patronizing that fellow named so-and-so, living in abundance, being patronized, honoured, respected, worshipped amongst families, but they do not patronize, honour, respect, worship me, an ascetic who live a rough life!’ Thus envy and jealousy does not arise in him because of those householders.

Nigrodha, that an ascetic sees another recluse or brahmin being patronized, honoured, respected, worshipped amongst families, but does not think: ‘They are patronizing that fellow named so-and-so, living in abundance, being patronized, honoured, respected, worshipped amongst families, but they do not patronize, honour, respect, worship me, an ascetic who live a rough life!’ Thus envy and jealousy does not arise in him because of those householders—to that extent, he is purified.

(11) Furthermore, Nigrodha, an ascetic is not one who sits before the people in public.

Nigrodha, that an ascetic is not one who sits before the people in public—to that extent, he is purified.

(12) Furthermore, Nigrodha, an ascetic does not go about ostentatiously among the families, as if to say: ‘Look at this asceticism of mine! Look at this asceticism of mine!’

Nigrodha, that an ascetic does not go about ostentatiously among the families, as if to say: ‘Look at this asceticism of mine! Look at this asceticism of mine!’—to that extent, he is purified.

(13) Furthermore, Nigrodha, an ascetic does not resort to underhand conduct. On being asked: ‘Do you approve of this?’, when he does not approve, he says, ‘I do not approve,’ or when he does approve, he says, ‘I do approve.’ In this way, he does not tell a deliberate lie.

Nigrodha, that an ascetic does not resort to underhand conduct, on being asked: ‘Do you approve of this?’, when he does not approve, he says, ‘I do not approve,’ or when he does approve, he says, ‘I do approve; in this way, he does not tell a deliberate lie—to that extent, he is purified.

15a (14) Furthermore, Nigrodha, an ascetic, when the Tathāgata or a Tathāgata’s disciple presents the Dharma in a way that deserves his assent, gives his assent—to that extent, he is purified.

(15) Furthermore, Nigrodha, an ascetic is neither angry nor ill-tempered. Nigrodha, that an ascetic is neither angry nor ill-tempered—to that extent, he is purified.

(16) Furthermore, Nigrodha, an ascetic is neither mean nor spiteful. Nigrodha, that an ascetic is neither mean nor spiteful—to that extent, he is purified.

An ascetic is neither envious nor jealous. Nigrodha, that an ascetic is neither envious nor jealous—to that extent, he is purified.

⁴⁸ Read *ajjhopanno* (see CPD), “being addicted to, being enthralled by,” (to enjoy doing something) with relish. PTS has *ajjhāpanna*, “with guilt,” guiltily.

An ascetic is neither crafty nor deceitful. Nigrodha, that an ascetic is neither crafty nor deceitful—to that extent, he is purified.

An ascetic is neither obstinate nor [48] proud. Nigrodha, that an ascetic is neither obstinate nor proud—to that extent, he is purified.

An ascetic neither has evil desires nor is he under their sway. Nigrodha, that an ascetic neither has evil desires nor is he under their sway—to that extent, he is purified.

An ascetic neither holds wrong views nor is he given to extreme opinions. Nigrodha, that an ascetic neither holds wrong views nor is he given to extreme opinions—to that extent, he is purified.

An ascetic is neither stuck in self-view, firmly holding on to it, unable to let it go. Nigrodha, that an ascetic is neither stuck in self-view, firmly holding on to it, unable to let it go—to that extent, he is purified.

15b What do you think, Nigrodha: is the asceticism of loathsomeness purified by these things or not?”

“Certainly it is, bhante, it reaches its peak here, *penetrating the heartwood*.”

The heartwood parable

15c “No, Nigrodha, it does not reach its peak there, penetrating the heartwood. It has only reached the loose outer bark!”⁴⁹

16a “Well then, bhante, how does the asceticism of loathsomeness reach its peak, penetrating the heartwood? It would be good, bhante, if the Blessed One were to cause my asceticism of loathsomeness to reach its peak, penetrating the heartwood!”

The fourfold restraint

16b “Here, Nigrodha, an ascetic observes the fourfold restraint.⁵⁰ And what is the fourfold restraint? Here, Nigrodha, an ascetic

(1) does not harm a living being, nor cause any to be harmed, nor does he approve of such harming;

[49] (2) he does not take the not-given, nor cause any to be taken, nor does he approve of such taking;

(3) he does not tell a lie, nor cause any lie to be told, nor approve of such lying;

(4) he does not desire for sense-pleasure,⁵¹ nor cause others to do so, nor approve of such desire.

In this way, an ascetic observes the fourfold restraint. And through this restraint, through making this his austerity, he moves upwards [spiritually] and does not fall back into lower things.

The five hindrances⁵²

16c Then he resorts to a solitary lodging, a forest, foot of a tree, a mountain gully, a mountain cave, a charnel ground, a jungle thicket, the open air, a heap of straw. Then on returning from the alms-round, having eaten, he sits down cross-legged and holding his body erect, establishes mindfulness before him.

Abandoning covetousness⁵³ for the world, he dwells with a mind free from such covetousness, and his mind is purified of covetousness.

⁴⁹ “The loose outer bark,” *papaṭika*, ie pieces of dry bark that flake off. Cf §§17b, 18c, 19c. This imagery forms part of a series of similes in reference to the parts of a tree: see Intro. See **Madhu,piṇḍika S** (M 18.12/1:111) and **Ānāpāna,sati S** (M 118.8/3:80) for other applications of the heartwood (*sāra*) simile.

⁵⁰ *Catu,yāma,samvara*, D 1:57, 3:48; S 1:66; M 1:377; Vism 416. This is the practice of the Jain recluse (*muni*). See Prasad 1926:704 f.

⁵¹ *Na bhāvitam āsamsati*. A difficult reading that Comy explains as “he does not crave for sense-pleasures” which D:RD follows. Cf Walshe: D:W n766.

⁵² For details, see **Sāmañña,phala S** (D 2.68-74/2:71-73) & **Sanḅārava S** (S 46.55/5:121-126). Both employ colourful similes.

⁵³ “Covetousness,” *abhijjhā* = *kāma*-, *chanda*, which is the more usual term (A 3:62; Vbh 378). Alt tr “longing.”

Abandoning ill-will and hatred, he dwells with a mind free from them, and by compassion for all living beings, his mind is purified of ill-will.

Abandoning sloth and torpor, he dwells with a mind purified of them, and by the perception of light, mindful and fully comprehending, his mind is purified of sloth and torpor.

Abandoning restlessness and worry, he dwells with a mind purified of them, and by a pacified mind is purified of restlessness and worry.

Abandoning doubt, he dwells having overcome doubt, without uncertainty regarding the wholesome, his mind is purified of doubt.

The four immeasurables⁵⁴

17a (1) THE CULTIVATION OF LOVINGKINDNESS. Having abandoned these five hindrances, and in order to weaken the impurities of the mind by applying insight,⁵⁵

he dwells letting his mind, filled with lovingkindness, pervade one quarter, then the second, then the third, then the fourth quarter. And so he continues to pervade the whole world, above, below, across and everywhere with a mind full of lovingkindness, bountiful, [50] grown great,⁵⁶ boundless, free from hatred and ill-will.

(2) THE CULTIVATION OF COMPASSION. Having abandoned these five hindrances, and in order to weaken the impurities of the mind by applying insight,

he dwells letting his mind, filled with compassion, pervade one quarter, then the second, then the third, then the fourth quarter. And so he continues to pervade the whole world, above, below, across and everywhere with a mind full of compassion, bountiful, grown great, boundless, free from hatred and ill-will.

(3) THE CULTIVATION OF APPRECIATIVE JOY. Having abandoned these five hindrances, and in order to weaken the impurities of the mind by applying insight, he dwells

letting his mind, filled with appreciative joy, pervade the whole world, above, below, across and everywhere with a mind full of appreciative joy, bountiful, grown great, boundless, free from hatred and ill-will.

(4) THE CULTIVATION OF EQUANIMITY. Having abandoned these five hindrances, and in order to weaken the impurities of the mind by applying insight,

he dwells letting his mind, filled with equanimity, pervade one quarter, then the second, then the third, then the fourth quarter. And so he continues to pervade the whole world, above, below, across and everywhere with a mind full of equanimity, bountiful, [50] grown great, boundless, free from hatred and ill-will.

17b What do you think, Nigrodha: is the asceticism of loathsomeness purified by these things or not?"

"Certainly it is, bhante, it reaches its peak here, penetrating the heartwood."

"No, Nigrodha, it does not reach its peak there, penetrating the heartwood. It has only reached the bark!"⁵⁷

18a "Well then, bhante, how does the asceticism of loathsomeness reach its peak, penetrating the heartwood? It would be good, bhante, if the Blessed One were to cause my asceticism of loathsomeness to attain to its peak, penetrating the heartwood!"

⁵⁴ For a description of the immeasurable or divine abodes with similes, see **Tevijja S** (D 13.76-79/1:251) = sd 1.8. On the divine abodes with the elements, see **Vuṭṭha Vass'āvāsa S** (A 9.11.4/4:375 f) = SD 28.21. On how the divine abodes limit karma, see **Brahma, vihāra S** (A 10.206/5:299) = SD 2.10.

⁵⁵ *So ime pañca nīvarane pahāya cetaso upakkilese paññāya dubbalī, karane.*

⁵⁶ The mind "grown great" (*mahaggattā*) or exalted perception refers to the mind in dhyana, ie in the form sphere (*rūpāvacara*). See **Catuttha Jhāna Pañha S** (S 40.4) = SD 24.14 Intro (4).

⁵⁷ "The bark," *taca* [cf §15b]. See **Madhu, piṇḍika S** (M 18.12) and **Ānāpāna, sati S** (M 118.8) for other applications of the heartwood (*sāra*) simile.

The fourfold restraint

18b “Here, Nigrodha, an ascetic who observes the fourfold restraint. And what is the fourfold restraint? Here, Nigrodha, an ascetic

- (1) does not harm a living being, nor cause any to be harmed, nor does he approve of such harming;
- (2) he does not take the not-given, nor cause any to be taken, nor does he approve of such taking;
- (3) he does not tell a lie, nor cause any lie to be told, nor approve of such lying;
- (4) he does not desire for sense-pleasure,⁵⁸ nor cause others to do so, nor approve of such desire.

In this way, an ascetic observes the fourfold restraint. And through this restraint, through making this his austerity, he moves upwards [spiritually] and does not fall back into lower things.

The five hindrances abandoned

18c Then he resorts to a solitary lodging, a forest, foot of a tree, a mountain gully, a mountain cave, a charnel ground, a jungle thicket, the open air, a heap of straw. Then on returning from the alms-round, having eaten, he sits down cross-legged and holding his body erect, establishes mindfulness before him.

Abandoning covetousness⁵⁹ for the world, he dwells with a mind free from such covetousness, and his mind is purified of covetousness.

Abandoning ill-will and hatred, he dwells with a mind free from them, and by compassion for all living beings, his mind is purified of ill-will.

Abandoning sloth and torpor, he dwells with a mind purified of them, and by the perception of light, mindful and fully comprehending, his mind is purified of sloth and torpor.

Abandoning restlessness and worry, he dwells with a mind purified of them, and by a pacified mind is purified of restlessness and worry.

Abandoning doubt, he dwells having overcome doubt, without uncertainty regarding the wholesome, his mind is purified of doubt.

The four immeasurables attained

18d (1) THE CULTIVATION OF LOVINGKINDNESS. Having abandoned these five hindrances, and in order to weaken the impurities of the mind by applying insight,⁶⁰

he dwells letting his mind, filled with lovingkindness, pervade one quarter, then the second, then the third, then the fourth quarter. And so he continues to pervade the whole world, above, below, across and everywhere with a mind full of lovingkindness, bountiful, [50] grown great,⁶¹ boundless, free from hatred and ill-will.

(2) THE CULTIVATION OF COMPASSION. Having abandoned these five hindrances, and in order to weaken the impurities of the mind by applying insight,

he dwells letting his mind, filled with compassion, pervade one quarter, then the second, then the third, then the fourth quarter. And so he continues to pervade the whole world, above, below, across and everywhere with a mind full of compassion, bountiful, grown great, boundless, free from hatred and ill-will.

(3) THE CULTIVATION OF APPRECIATIVE JOY. Having abandoned these five hindrances, and in order to weaken the impurities of the mind by applying insight, he dwells

letting his mind, filled with appreciative joy, pervade the whole world, above, below, across and everywhere with a mind full of appreciative joy, bountiful, grown great, boundless, free from hatred and ill-will.

⁵⁸ *Na bhāvitam āsaṃsati*. A difficult reading that Comy explains as “he does not crave for sense-pleasures” which D:RD follows. Cf Walshe: D:W n766.

⁵⁹ “Covetousness,” *abhiṇṇhā* = *kāma*-, *chanda*, which is the more usual term (A 3:62; Vbh 378). Alt tr “longing.”

⁶⁰ *So ime pañca nīvaraṇa pahāya cetaso upakkilese paññāya dubbalī, karaṇe*.

⁶¹ The mind “grown great” (*mahaggattā*) or exalted perception refers to the mind in dhyana, ie in the form sphere (*rūpāvacara*). See **Catuttha Jhāna Pañha S** (S 40.4) = SD 24.14 Intro (4).

(4) THE CULTIVATION OF EQUANIMITY. Having abandoned these five hindrances, and in order to weaken the impurities of the mind by applying insight,

he dwells letting his mind, filled with equanimity, pervade one quarter, then the second, then the third, then the fourth quarter. And so he continues to pervade the whole world, above, below, across and everywhere with a mind full of equanimity, bountiful, grown great, boundless, free from hatred and ill-will.

Recollection of past lives: the sapwood

18e He recalls various **recalls his manifold past existence**, that is to say,
one birth, two, three, four, five births,
ten births, twenty, thirty, forty, fifty births,
one hundred births, one thousand births, one hundred thousand births, thus:

‘There I had such a name, belonged to such a clan, had such an appearance. Such was my food, such my experience of joy and pain, such the end of my life. Passing away from that state, I re-arose there. There too I had such a name, belonged to such a clan, had such an appearance. Such was my food, such my experience of joy and pain, such my life-span. Passing away from that state, I re-arose here.’⁶² [51]

Thus he recalls his manifold past existence in their modes and their details.⁶³

18c What do you think, Nigrodha—is the asceticism of loathsomeness purified by these things or not?”

“Certainly it is, bhante, it attains its peak here, penetrating the heartwood.”

“No, Nigrodha, it does not attain its peak there, penetrating to the heartwood. It has only reached the sapwood!”⁶⁴

19a “Well then, bhante, how does the asceticism of loathsomeness reach its peak, penetrating the heartwood? It would be good, bhante, if the Blessed One were to cause my asceticism of loathsomeness to reach its peak, penetrating the heartwood!”

The divine eye: the “heartwood”

19b “Here, Nigrodha, an ascetic who observes the fourfold restraint. And what is the fourfold restraint? Here, Nigrodha, an ascetic

- (1) does not harm a living being, nor cause any to be harmed, nor does he approve of such harming;
- (2) he does not take the not-given, nor cause any to be taken, nor does he approve of such taking;
- (3) he does not tell a lie, nor cause any lie to be told, nor approve of such lying;
- (4) he does not desire for sense-pleasure,⁶⁵ nor cause others to do so, nor approve of such desire.

In this way, an ascetic observes the fourfold restraint. And through this restraint, through making this his austerity, he moves upwards [spiritually] and does not fall back into lower things.

The five hindrances abandoned

19c Then he resorts to a solitary lodging, a forest, foot of a tree, a mountain gully, a mountain cave, a charnel ground, a jungle thicket, the open air, a heap of straw. Then on returning from the alms-round, having eaten, he sits down cross-legged and holding his body erect, establishes mindfulness before him.

Abandoning covetousness⁶⁶ for the world, he dwells with a mind free from such covetousness, and his mind is purified of covetousness.

⁶² This para as in **Sampasādanīya S** (D 28.15.1/3:108 f). For details, see Vism 13.13-71/411-423.

⁶³ As in **Sāmañña,phala S** (D 2.93/1:81).

⁶⁴ “The sapwood,” *pheggu*, ie the fibre surrounding the pith [cf §15b]. Cf M 29. See also **Madhu,piṇḍika S** (M 18.12/1:111) and **Ānāpāna,sati S** (M 118.8) for other applications of the heartwood (*sāra*) simile.

⁶⁵ *Na bhāvitam āsaṃsati*. A difficult reading that Comy explains as “he does not crave for sense-pleasures” which D:RD follows. Cf Walshe: D:W n766.

⁶⁶ “Covetousness,” *abhijjhā* = *kāma*-, *chanda*, which is the more usual term (A 3:62; Vbh 378). Alt tr “longing.”

Abandoning ill-will and hatred, he dwells with a mind free from them, and by compassion for all living beings, his mind is purified of ill-will.

Abandoning sloth and torpor, he dwells with a mind purified of them, and by the perception of light, mindful and fully comprehending, his mind is purified of sloth and torpor.

Abandoning restlessness and worry, he dwells with a mind purified of them, and by a pacified mind is purified of restlessness and worry.

Abandoning doubt, he dwells having overcome doubt, without uncertainty regarding the wholesome, his mind is purified of doubt.

The four immeasurables attained

19d (1) THE CULTIVATION OF LOVINGKINDNESS. Having abandoned these five hindrances, and in order to weaken the impurities of the mind by applying insight,⁶⁷

he dwells letting his mind, filled with lovingkindness, pervade one quarter, then the second, then the third, then the fourth quarter. And so he continues to pervade the whole world, above, below, across and everywhere with a mind full of lovingkindness, bountiful, grown great,⁶⁸ boundless, free from hatred and ill-will.

(2) THE CULTIVATION OF COMPASSION. Having abandoned these five hindrances, and in order to weaken the impurities of the mind by applying insight,

he dwells letting his mind, filled with compassion, pervade one quarter, then the second, then the third, then the fourth quarter. And so he continues to pervade the whole world, above, below, across and everywhere with a mind full of compassion, bountiful, grown great, boundless, free from hatred and ill-will.

(3) THE CULTIVATION OF APPRECIATIVE JOY. Having abandoned these five hindrances, and in order to weaken the impurities of the mind by applying insight, he dwells

letting his mind, filled with appreciative joy, pervade the whole world, above, below, across and everywhere with a mind full of appreciative joy, bountiful, grown great, boundless, free from hatred and ill-will.

(4) THE CULTIVATION OF EQUANIMITY. Having abandoned these five hindrances, and in order to weaken the impurities of the mind by applying insight,

he dwells letting his mind, filled with equanimity, pervade one quarter, then the second, then the third, then the fourth quarter. And so he continues to pervade the whole world, above, below, across and everywhere with a mind full of equanimity, bountiful, grown great, boundless, free from hatred and ill-will.

Thus he [52] recalls various past lives with their conditions and details. And then, by means of **the divine eye** [clairvoyance],⁶⁹ purified and surpassing the human—beings passing away and re-arising, and he knows how they are inferior and superior, beautiful and ugly, fortunate and unfortunate, in the heavens, in the suffering states, faring in accordance with their karma.

19e What do you think, Nigrodha—is the asceticism of loathsomeness purified by these things or not?”

“Certainly it is, bhante, it attains its peak here, penetrating the heartwood.”

“Yes, indeed it is, Nigrodha, that austerity is so purified as to reach its peak here, penetrating to the pith. It has reached the pith.⁷⁰

⁶⁷ So ime pañca nīvaraṇe pahāya cetaso upakkilese paññāya dubbalī, karaṇe.

⁶⁸ The mind “grown great” (*mahaggatā*) or exalted perception refers to the mind in dhyana, ie in the form sphere (*rūpāvacara*). See **Catuttha Jhāna Pañha S** (S 40.4) = SD 24.14 Intro (4).

⁶⁹ *Dibba, cakkhu*, clairvoyance, not to be confused with the Dharma-eye (*dhmma, cakkhu*) (see n in §104). On the relationship of this knowledge to the 62 grounds for wrong views, see **Brahma, jāla S** (D 1) = SD 25.3(76.3). See prec n.

⁷⁰ “Pith,” *sāra*, or “heartwood,” ie, the core or essence of anything; the pith or the best of wood—a simile for spiritual strength and attainment. Here, the Buddha’s humour is evident in such a simile given in the latter (D 25.15-19/3:47-53) = 1.4). See **Madhu, piṇḍika S** (M 18.12/1:111) = SD 6.14. In (**Saṅgha**) **Upasatha S** (A 4.190.1b/2:182)

19f And so, Nigrodha, when you ask: ‘*Venerable sir, what is the doctrine in which the Blessed One trains his disciples, and which those disciples so trained as to benefit from it regard as their principal support and the fundamentals of the holy life?*’ (let me say that) I train my disciples in something higher and finer through which they recognize as their principal support and the fundamentals of the holy life.”

When this was said, a great commotion arose amongst the wanderers:

“We and our teaching are ruined! We know of nothing higher or more far-reaching!” **[53]**

Sandhāna’s retort

20 And when the householder Sandhāna realized that these wanderers outside the faith were actually heeding the Blessed One’s word, giving ear to it, directing their minds towards direct knowledge, he said to Nigrodha:

“Venerable Nigrodha, you had said to me:

‘*Well now, householder, do you know with whom the recluse Gotama talks?...[as in §5]...if the recluse Gotama were to come to this assembly, we would baffle him with a single question, we would knock him over like an empty pot!*’

So now that the Blessed One has come here, why don’t you baffle him with a single question and knock him over like an empty pot?”

And at these words, the wanderer Nigrodha sat silent, dismayed, his shoulders drooping, hanging his head, downcast, at a loss for words.

The Buddha’s admonition

21 Seeing that the wanderer Nigrodha was silent...bewildered, the Blessed One said:

“Is it true, Nigrodha, that you said those words?” **[54]**

“Bhante, it is true that I said those words—foolishly, mistakenly, unskillfully.”

“What do you think, Nigrodha—have you heard it said by wanderers who were old, venerable, teachers and the teachers of teachers, that those who in the past were arhats, fully self-awakened Buddhas used to talk, when they gather, by shouting, screaming, making a great noise, and indulging in low talk... [as in §2]...like you with your teaching?

Or did they not say rather that those Blessed Ones resort to dwelling in the forest, in the jungle, free from noise, with little sound, alone with the winds, away from humans, conducive for seclusion, just as I do now?”

“Bhante, I have heard it said that those who were arhats, fully self-awakened Buddhas did not indulge in loud talk nor low talk...but resort to dwelling in the forest...just as the Blessed One does now.”

“Nigrodha, you are an intelligent man of mature years. Has it never occurred to you that,

‘*Having awakened himself, the Blessed One teaches the Dharma of awakening;*

having tamed [disciplined] himself, the Blessed One teaches the Dharma for taming oneself;

having calmed himself, the Blessed One teaches the Dharma leading to calm;

having gone beyond (suffering) himself, [55] the Blessed One teaches the Dharma for going beyond (to the far shore of awakening);

having attained nirvana himself, the Blessed One teaches the Dharma for the sake of nirvana?’”⁷¹

= SD 15.10b, *sāra* means “essence,” in the sense of accomplished in moral virtue, etc (AA 3:168). Cf §15b. See §18c n.

⁷¹ *Buddho so bhagavā bodhāya dhammaṃ deseti; danto so bhagavā damathāya dhammaṃ deseti; santo so bhagavā samathāya dhammaṃ deseti; tiṇṇo so bhagavā tarāyā dhammaṃ deseti; parinibbuto so bhagavā parinibbāyā dhammaṃ deseti ti.* Also at **Cūḷa Saccaka S** (D 35.26/3:235). This passage and its Chinese Āgama parallel (T1 = 1.49a26-28 & T11 = 1.226a4-7) have been cited as the locus classicus of the Bodhisattva vows, such as that found in the early Mahāyāna work, **Ugra Paripṛcchā**: “The unrescued I will rescue. The unliberated I will liberate. The uncomforted I will comfort. Those who have not yet reached parinirvana I will cause to attain parinirvana.” (UgraP:N §2C)—also found in **Avadāna Śataka**, **Aṣṭa, sahaśrikā Prajñā, pāramitā** (Chin tr Lokakṣema & Chih Ch’ien), **Saddharma Puṇḍarīka Sūtra** (Lotus Sutra) (Chin tr Dharmarakṣa & Kumārajīva), and **Karuṇā, puṇḍarī-**

Nigrodha's confession

22a When this was said, the wanderer Nigrodha said to the Blessed One:

"I have transgressed, bhante! Foolish, mistaken and inept as I was, that I spoke thus of the Blessed One. May the Blessed One forgive this transgression that I may restrain myself in future!"⁷²

"Indeed, Nigrodha, you have transgressed through your being foolish, mistaken and inept that you spoke thus of me. But since you recognize the nature of your transgression and make amends as is proper, we⁷³ forgive your transgression.

For, Nigrodha, it is a mark of progress in the discipline of the noble ones, if anyone recognizes the nature of his transgression and makes amends as is right, restraining himself in future.

The Buddha's challenge

22b But, Nigrodha, I tell you this:

Let an intelligent person come to me, who is honest, trustworthy, upright,⁷⁴ and I will instruct him, I will teach him the Dharma. If he practises what he is taught, then, to attain for himself here and now that supreme goal of the holy life, for the sake of which sons of family go forth from the household life into the homeless state, will take him *seven years*.⁷⁵

Let alone seven years, Nigrodha. If he practises what he is taught, then to attain for himself here and now that supreme goal of the holy life, for the sake of which sons of family go forth from the household life into the homeless state, will take him *six years,...five years,...four years,...three years,...two years,...one year*.

Let alone one year, Nigrodha. If he practises what he is taught, then to attain for himself here and now that supreme goal of the holy life, for the sake of which sons of family go forth from the household life into the homeless state, will take him *seven months, [56] ...four months,...three months,...two months,...one month,...half a month*.

Let alone half a month, Nigrodha, let an intelligent man come to me, who is honest, trustworthy, upright, and I will instruct him, I will teach him the Dharma. If he practises what he is taught, then, to attain for himself here and now that supreme goal of the holy life, for the sake of which sons of family go forth from the household life into the homeless state, will take him *seven days*.

23 Nigrodha, you may think, 'The recluse Gotama says this out of desire to win disciples.' But you should not think so. Let whoever is your teacher remain as your teacher.

Nigrodha, you may think, 'The recluse Gotama says this out of desire to make us fall from our rules.' **[57]** ... Let your rules remain as your rules.

Nigrodha, you may think, 'The recluse Gotama says this out of desire to make us fall from our livelihood... Let your livelihood remain as your livelihood.

ka Sūtra (with a variant 3rd vow. A differing version of the vow is found in **Dīpaṅkara jātaḥ, Mahāvastu, Aṣṭa-saḥśrikā Prajñā, pāramitā** (in the extant Skt and in Kumārajīva's Chin tr), **Pañca, viṃśati, saḥśrikā Prajñā, pāramitā** (Chin trs of Mokṣala, Kumārajīva, & Xuanzhang) and some Skt MSS of **Lotus Sūtra**, thus: "Having crossed over, I will rescue (others). Liberated, I will liberate (others), Comforted, I will comfort (others). Having attained parinirvana, I will cause (others) to attain parinirvana." See KAGAWA Takao, "Shi guzeigan no genryū" [The origins of the four universal vows], *Indodaku bukkyōgaku kenkyū* 30,1 1989:294-302; & UgraP:N 147-151.

⁷² Cf Ajātasattu's confession in **Sāmañña, phala S** (D 2.99 ff).

⁷³ "We forgive," *paṭigaṇhāma*, lit "we accept"; here the 1st pl is not the royal pronoun, but the Buddha, on behalf of the Sangha, forgives the transgression.

⁷⁴ "Honest, trustworthy, upright," *asaṭho amāyāvī uju, jātiko* (= M 2:44/80.16), lit "not treacherous, not deceitful, straightforward." M:ÑB has "honest and sincere, a man of rectitude" (M:ÑB 664)

⁷⁵ *Etu viññū puriso asaṭho amāyāvī uju, jātiko, aham anusāsāmi aham dhammam desemi. Yathā'nusiṭṭham tathā paṭipajjamāno—yass'atthāya kula, puttā samma-d-eva agārasmā anagāriyam pabbajanti, tad anuttaram—brahma, cariya, pariyoṣānam diṭṭh'eva dhamme sayam abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja viharissati satta, vassāni.* This section on the Buddha's "prediction" of realization is also found in **Mahā Satipaṭṭhāna S** (D 22.22) and **Satipaṭṭhāna S** (M 10.46) = SD 13, & also Analayo, *Satipaṭṭhāna: The direct path to realization*, 2003:250-257.

Nigrodha, you may think, ‘The recluse Gotama says this with the desire to establish us in the unwholesome things along with teachings considered unwholesome.’ ... Let what you consider unwholesome continue to be so considered.

Nigrodha, you may think, ‘The recluse Gotama says this with the desire to separate us from the wholesome things along with teachings considered wholesome.’ ... Let what you consider wholesome continue to be so considered.

—I do not speak for any of these reasons.

*There are, Nigrodha, unwholesome things that have not been abandoned, defiled, conducive to rebirth, fearful, productive of painful results in the future, associated with birth, decay and death. It is for the abandonment of these things that I teach Dharma.*⁷⁶

If you practise accordingly, these defiled states will be abandoned, the states that purify will increase, and by your direct knowledge, you will realize, here and now, the bountiful perfection of wisdom.”⁷⁷

Māra the Evil One

24 When this was said, the wanderers sat silent, dismayed, their shoulders drooping, hanging their heads, downcast, at a loss for words, so possessed were their minds by Māra [the Evil One].⁷⁸

Then the Blessed One said:

“Every one of these hollow men⁷⁹ is possessed by the Evil One, so that not even one of them thinks: ‘Let us now follow the holy life proclaimed by the recluse Gotama, that we may know it—for what do seven days matter?’”

Then the Blessed One, having uttered the lion-roar⁸⁰ in the Udumbarikā Wanderer’s Park, rose up into the air and returned to the Vultures’ Peak. And the householder Sandhāna, too, returned to Rājagaha.⁸¹

— evaṃ —

100706

⁷⁶ *Santi ca kho Nigrodha, akusalā dhammā appahīṇā saṅkilesikā ponobhavikā sadarā dukkha, vipākā āyatim jāti, jarā, maraṇiyā, yesāhaṃ pahānāya dhammaṃ desemi yathā paṭipannānaṃ vo saṅkilesikā dhammā pahīyissanti.*

⁷⁷ *Yathā, paṭipannānaṃ vo saṅkilesikā dhammā pahīyissanti, vodānīyā dhammā abhivaḍḍhissanti, paññā, pāri-pūrim vepullattaṃ ca diṭṭh’eva dhamme sayam abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja viharissathā ti.* On the significance of this whole passage, see SD 19.1(7.3).

⁷⁸ Like Ānanda in **Mahā Parinibbāna S** (D 16.3.4/2:103). In both cases, it is obvious that “**Māra**” refers to a distracted mind that is unable to comprehend the significance of the Buddha’s invitation. If it were really Māra the deity, the Buddha could have easily exposed him. It is interesting to see here that Māra is always dealt with the person himself, and not “exorcised” by another. This further points to the fact that Māra is the distracted mind.

⁷⁹ *Mogha, purisa*, lit “empty person.” I’ve followed a safe well-tested translation here. However, while *mogha* evokes more deeply a spiritual lack, “misguided” connotes more of psychosocial errancy. Cf TS Eliot’s “Hollow Men” (where “empty men” is also mentioned) which fully brings out the meaning here but lacks emotional connection for those unfamiliar with the poem.

⁸⁰ “Lion-roar,” *sīha, nāda*. See Intro (2.2).

⁸¹ Comy says that although the Buddha’s word was unsuccessful at that time, they benefitted the wanderers in the future (DA 3:844).